
BOOK REVIEW/COMPTE RENDU

Gonzales, Roberto G., Nando Sigona, Martha C. Franco, and Anna Papoutsis. 2019. *Undocumented Migration: Borders, Immigration Enforcement, and Belonging*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, paper, (9781509506941).

Undocumented Migration provides insightful and timely discussions to reflect on how ‘becoming’ an undocumented migrant is a process woven at multiple scales of the social realm (p.20). Gonzales, Sigona, Franco and Papoutsis describe how macro structural factors, global and local forms of governance, as well as everyday interactions, simultaneously configure experiences of ‘illegality’ among undocumented migrants. The authors frame their research within the scholarship that studies how the nation-state produces illegality while determining boundaries of membership among citizens and noncitizens. However, it broadens the scope by delving into how different forms of illegalized human mobility are shaped between national and supranational contexts, varying according to immigration laws, notions of citizenship, and forms of formal and informal membership in nation-states (p.17). The authors analyze cases in the U.S., EU, and UK, using the concept of *illegality assemblage* as an interpretative tool to trace how illegality is produced at the intersection of actors and institutional layers of governance.

Chapter one asks: ‘Who are undocumented migrants?’. It poses theoretical views to rethink the notion of undocumented migration. The authors point out how legal frameworks legitimate and categorize forms of migration, outlining how these institutional stances also determine parameters of inclusion and exclusion by establishing constraints and entitlements to migrants in the receiving contexts (p.17). The authors’ analysis invites the reader to think about illegality and undocumented migration as imbricated categories, stressing how ranges of immigration statuses label migrants producing different experiences of illegality (p. 17). Gonzales et. al stress that immigration statuses are ‘fluid’, contingent, not static; conditioned to policy and legal shifts of a country’s polity (p.25). Thus, they trace how structures, actors and processes are involved configuring experiences of illegality within undocumented migration. Moreover, by differentiating between undocumented journeys and undocumented stays, Gonzales et. al portray how the ‘fluidity’

of immigrant statuses works. They argue that undocumented journeys could lead to gain a formal status of membership, while undocumented stays could subject individuals to experience illegality and face the threat of deportation.

The second chapter develops insightful debates looking at the edges of citizenship, membership and belonging, tracing “links [of] macro-societal processes” and undocumented migrants’ ‘embodiment’ of illegality (p.39, 45). In this section, Gonzales et. al outline the ambiguities that forge the ‘dual essence of citizenship’ (p.38). The authors stress the differences between formal and informal modes of membership, considering how undocumented migrants forge networks, ties of belonging, and community participation regardless of lacking a legal status to claim formal membership in the nation-state. The chapter conveys how forms of ‘belonging’, ‘legality’ and ‘illegality’ overlap by outlining how people holding formal citizenship also experience exclusion and lack of community participation. Therefore, the authors argue that broader discussions around citizenship are needed, considering that formal ways of membership do not grant a sense of belonging, as legal statuses do not necessarily assure “protection against precariousness and vulnerability to state power” (p.53). Accordingly, Gonzales et al. with other scholars, advocate for cultural and social citizenship, serving as an inclusive alternative to acknowledge undocumented migrants as legitimate and political subjects (p.48).

Although undocumented migration encompasses an enmeshed set of experiences, Gonzales et. al outline outstanding traits affecting migrants’ trajectories. The outcomes of not legally existing within a formal membership framework is reflected in limited access to public and social services, housing, labour market and political participation. By describing Sergio’s trajectory, and mixed-status families’ journeys in chapter six, the authors point out how undocumented migrants endure relationship fractures, isolation, and are vulnerable to experiences of violence, abuse, precariousness and other constraints (p.55). Undocumented migrants cope with adverse conditions, which also force them to internalize self-disciplinary practices to avoid the risk of deportation. Considering all of this, the authors stress that it is essential to recognize how undocumented migrants struggle with anxiety and instability, and examine how their mental, emotional and wellbeing is affected.

Geographies of Undocumented Migration emphasizes that subnational realms like in the US enable gradations of belonging and exclusion that clang with national policies of formal membership. While in cities like New York, undocumented migrants are entitled to hold a municipal identification to access services, the state of South Carolina does

not allow them to hold a driver's license. Gonzales et. al invite us to think of how "regimes of rights", established at the level of the nation-state's territory, are reshaped in subnational spheres, blurring the dichotomous boundaries of legality and illegality (p.63). They portray nuances in inclusion and exclusion at the level of cities in different countries. In between these levels, notions of legality and illegality coexist and are strained. Gonzales et. al explain how looking at the city scale enables us to analyze forms of connections and ruptures of local and national politics of belonging and membership. They also acknowledge that certain locations are more or less welcoming to undocumented migrants.

Chapter four provides an overview of current mechanisms of immigration enforcement which portrays how the criminalization of migrants is located at subnational and national realms. The authors trace how 'soft enforcement' measures produce unwelcoming environments for undocumented migrants when accessing public spaces in different contexts (p. 80). These practices aim to persuade them to voluntarily return to their home countries and to prevent the arrival of new immigrants. This angle of the study invites readers to think about how dominant discourses of membership and belonging establish surveillance practices at the level of everyday interactions. Gonzales et al. draw on the case in the UK to depict how governments transpose discourses of "migrants as threats" (p. 94) by requesting healthcare providers implement immigration checks as a precondition to assisting patients. In this manner, Gonzales et. al explain how nets of immigration enforcement are configured, raising boundaries among those who legitimately belong and those who do not; creating sentiments of suspicion and profiling toward undocumented migrants. Similarly, the Criminal Alien Program (CAP) and the National Fugitive Operations Program (NFOP) in the US worked as surveillance practices to target undocumented migrants and "prevent [them] through deterrence" (p.89). The scholars emphasize that some groups tend to be more vulnerable to experiencing discrimination based on "racialized representations of illegality" (p.97). Approaching mechanisms of enforcement, detention and deportation, the book poses that immigration enforcement work at the intersection of western government policies and private corporations that provide surveillance technologies. A broader analysis of this angle would help readers better understand how exactly these dynamics are shaped.

Chapter five displays stories of undocumented migrants to shed light on how pathways for integration, inclusion and ways of exclusion in receiving contexts also depend on individuals' pre-migration backgrounds. The authors portray Julissa's and Jose Antonio's stories to illustrate how factors like education, class, nationality, racial and gender identity forged

their trajectories, networks and access to social mobility regardless of being undocumented. They explain how immigrants can amass social and economic capital through their educational background, regardless of their undocumented status (p. 105). However, these characteristics do not entirely protect them from experiencing illegality. Gonzales et al. display how intersected statuses are encompassed under a certain classification of undocumented migration, allowing the reader to understand the multiple factors at play in forging undocumented migrants' experiences within different contexts. Moreover, they highlight that the experience of being undocumented is also subjected to federal and local policies that often clash, whether working towards migrants' integration and social mobility, or their exclusion.

In the last two chapters, Gonzales et. al trace the outcomes of contradictory immigration policies looking at how families cope with the conditions of being undocumented. Adelita's story illustrates how mixed-status families are reconfigured while navigating precarious conditions to earn a living within a framework of continuously changing immigration regulations (p.124). The authors discuss how children in mixed-status families often take the lead to support their parent's language barriers. They also examine how youth experience "transition[s] to illegality" whilst facing limitations for being undocumented (p.143). At the same time, the authors portray how youth become political agents to overcome the exclusionary barriers that affect mixed-status families. This study emphasizes how immigrants can develop collective efforts and contest immigration enforcement. From this perspective, the migrant's agency is forged by collective actions that speak of the emergence of new ways of political belonging that overstep prevailing notions of citizenship and membership. The Migrant Caravan that reached the US-Mexico border in 2018, as well as the March for Freedom in 2012 in the EU, illustrate efforts to create an inclusive "political space for undocumented migrants" (p. 151). Moreover, the authors outline how politics of deservingness reinforce exclusionary practices and reproduce stereotypes of certain migrants as more or less deserving of earning legal status in certain countries.

This work engaged with invaluable inquires and provides useful analytical tools for future research on undocumented migration. The strength of the study lies in its multidimensional optic, stressing how continuous transformations of social, historical and political structures shape undocumented migration as a global phenomenon (p.26). A discussion on positionality would have benefited readers. Nevertheless, the book insightfully conveys why the notion of "undocumented migrant" is only meaningful in relation to the contexts and circumstances that define

it” (p.16), portraying a broader understanding of the multiple complexities that nowadays shape undocumented migration.

University of Alberta

Maria Fernanda Mosquera Garcia

Maria Fernanda Mosquera Garcia is an MA student of Sociology at the University of Alberta. She is interested in examining Latin Americans’ migration trajectories in Canada. Her research focuses on forced displacement experiences and forms of integration in Canada. She provides research assistantship for the Mobile Work and Mental Health Project, and also has participated in the University of Alberta Prison Project as a research assistant.

Email: mmosquer@ualberta.ca

