ARTICLES

Modes, Moods, and Musical Puns in Shakespeare's *The Winter's Tale**

112 Deanna Smid
Brandon University

In the final scene of *The Winter's Tale*, when Paulina commands "Musick, awake her; strike" to "revive" the statue of Hermione, what might Shakespeare's first audiences have heard? The question, of course, is unanswerable, for the sound of that ephemeral, breath-like music has been wholly lost, and yet, music—aural music—is vital to the last, climactic scene of the play, so its replication is worth the admittedly speculative attempt. Indeed, in *Music and Society in Early Modern England*, Christopher Marsh dryly argues, "Surely, if any scholar were to publish an account of twentieth-century popular culture that set music to one side, eyebrows would be raised and questions would be asked" (*Music* 26). He adds some advice: "We must often guess at how music sounded, relying for clues upon contemporary commentary that was highly charged or upon mediated sources that recorded aural forms of music in written form" (30). To imagine the sound of the restorative music in *The Winter's Tale*, "contemporary commentary" on the Renaissance theory of modes and their effect on mood is particularly helpful, I shall argue. Moreover, speculation about the "mode" of the music in *The Winter's Tale* may reveal a clever and subversive pun of Paulina's in the final scene.

If any stage directions for the music in Act V, scene iii even exist in early editions of the play, they are woefully unhelpful. Neither the first, second, third, nor fourth folios have any stage directions at all, and Nicholas Rowe's 1709 edition contains the rather unhelpful stage direction "Musick," as do most subsequent editions (973). Yet

conjectures about the original music need not be completely groundless, as recent scholarship on the play has demonstrated. John H. Long, for instance, argues that the verb "strike" could point to the appropriate instrument for the music: viols, for "strike" was usually used as a command for viols (90). John Pitcher, editor of the 2010 Arden Shakespeare edition of the play, also notes the pun on "vials" in Hermione's last speech: "You gods, look down, / And from your sacred vials pour your graces / Upon my daughter's head" (V.iii. 121-23). He compares this pun to a similar one in *Pericles*, in which Cerimon calls to his attendants, "The still and woeful music that we have, / Cause it to sound, beseech you. The vial once more. / How thou stirr'st, thou block! The music there! / I pray you give her air" (scene xii. 86-89), punning neatly on *viol* (stringed instrument) and *vial* (medicine) and on *air* and *ayre* (a musical composition). Shakespeare, of course, makes a similar pun in *Twelfth Night* with Viola, "a heroine who encloses the six-stringed instrument, the viol or 'viola-da-gamba' within her soubriquet" (Stern, "New Directions" 180).

The pun on *viol* and *air* may also further indict Leontes, I suggest. When Hermione faints in Act III, Leontes directs, "Take her hence. / Her heart is but o'ercharged; she will recover. / I have too much believed mine own suspicion. / Beseech you, tenderly apply to her / Some remedies of life" (III.ii. 147-51). The statue scene—carefully staged and blocked by Paulina—is reminiscent of the court scene of Act III, which was carefully staged and blocked by Leontes. In the court scene, Leontes's remedies of life are ineffectual, but the heavenly vials / viols of the final scene can awaken a statue.

Another critic, B.J. Sokol, briefly posits that "in accord with Hermione's inward as well as outward Majesty, the music that Paulina commands for Hermione's entry music would most appropriately be magnificent, perhaps a tucket or fanfare" (49). In his recent analysis of the sound of the music in V.iii., and in rather more detail than Sokol, Simon Smith traces the theory of "musical delight" in the play and in Renaissance music theory, and he notes the similarities between Hermione's resurrection and hermetic-alchemical texts containing "magical" music. Audiences would have recognized and accepted the alchemical magic of Paulina's song, he argues, for "[m]usic was constantly, diversely, being presented as having real power, making it unproblematic for contemporary playgoers to accept that its quickening power in this play is genuine" (382). And he, like Pitcher (and Sokol 48-49; Lyne 65), notes the possibility of viols as the instrument for the final music in the play (380). To find music's affective and therapeutic power, however, playgoers could have turned to a more commonplace early modern theory of music and its effects: the system of modes.

The name and number of the modes was generally in flux in Renaissance music theory because the modes were based on an incomplete and inaccurate assessment of ancient Greek music. Modes arose out of an attempt by medieval music theorists to classify various types of Gregorian chants and to create a memory aid so that people could easily recall them (Taruskin 74-86), and they continued to influence music practice and composition up to the sixteenth century (Perkins 80-86). To the tra-

ditional eight mode system—Mixolydian, Lydian, Phrygian, Dorian (the authentic modes) and the Hypomixolydian, Hypolydian, Hypophrygian, Hypodorian (the plagal modes)—sixteenth-century music theorist Heinrich Glarean added another four: the Aeolian, Hypoaelian, Ionian and Hypoionian (Morley 300-04; Atlas 556. For comprehensive summaries of the modal system, see also Meier; Mead; Scott, 98-103; Carter, 169-79; Palisca ch. 5).

A mode is (very simply) defined by its starting and ending notes. To imagine the sound of the Dorian mode, for instance, play a scale on a piano, starting on D and ending on D, playing only the white keys. The notes will likely sound unusual to a modern ear, for that modal system has been replaced by the tonal system; music might now be composed in D major or D minor, for instance, rather than in the Dorian mode.

Whether eight or twelve (or five, or fifteen, etc.) in number, the modes were clearly linked to diverse affective uses, as each mode, according to medieval and early modern music theorists, could and did elicit a distinct emotional and physical response. Music theorist Charles Butler even contends that modes are best understood by their effects rather than their tonal properties: "These [...] Moodes [...] are rightly describe[d] by the Effects" (2). Boethius likewise contends, "when rhythms and modes reach an intellect through the ears, they doubtless affect and reshape that mind according to their particular character" (3). The modes could do more than influence emotions and personalities: in the hands of a skilled and perceptive musician, modes could cure diseases, as Boethius argues: "By means of modes, Ismenias the Theban is said to have driven away all the distresses of many Boeotians suffering the torments of sciatica" (6). The modes were considered powerful, precise, and deliberate influences on the body and mind, and each mode—the Mixolydian, the Dorian, the Lydian, and the Phrygian, the Aeolian, and the Ionian, to use the modes that would have been most familiar and established while Shakespeare was writing—had a distinct and quantifiable effect.

"Mode" is sometimes spelled "mood" in early modern English musical texts, and the similarities between the two are in more than the spelling. Mode affects mood (and the entire body and mind), so the similarities between the two words offer the possibility of punning. Shakespeare uses "mood" at least twenty-three times in his plays, although not every instance of "mood" can be glossed as "mode." The editors of *Music in Shakespeare: A Dictionary* identify only one "mood" that has been interpreted as "mode": when King Henry tells Prince Hal in *2 Henry IV* that "my death / Changes the mood" (IV.v. 198-99; Wilson and Calore 282). "Mood" here may have a particularly musical meaning because "change" can mean "moving erroneously from one key to another" (Wilson and Calore 87). Most of the evidence for the influence of the individual modes and their effects on mood comes from anecdotal evidence in music manuals. I cite only six modes rather than twelve in this instance, for as John Case, the probable author of *The Praise of Musicke*, contends: "As for those others, *Hypodorius, Hypolydius, Hypophrygius*, and *Hypermyxolydius*, there is no doubt, but

that they being collaterall and assistants to these, move such like affection as their principall" (55).

The Praise of Musicke describes the Dorian mode in this way: "For *Modus Dorius*, beeing a grave and staied part of musicke, aunswereth to that which I called chast and temperate" (55), and Charles Butler and John Playford concur in their music manuals. Playford even adds that the Dorian mode "moveth to Sobriety and Godliness" (58). The Dorian mode is a wholesome, sanctioned, praiseworthy mode, suitable for psalms, hymns, and calming music.

The Phrygian mode is a different matter entirely, for as Case posits, "*Modus Phrygius* distracting the mind variably, also called *Bacchicus* for his great force and violence aunswereth to that which I called warlike" (55). Charles Butler agrees: "The *Phrygian* Moode is a manly and cooragious kinde of Musik, which, with his stately, or loud and violent tones, rouseth the spirit, and inciteth to arms and activiti" (2). Again, John Playford agrees; moreover, he adds a story about a Danish king who was so moved by the Phrygian mode that "he fell upon his most trusty friends which were near him, and slew some of them with his fist for lack of another weapon (60-61). Early modern music theorists seemed to have taken a certain bloodthirsty delight in the Phrygian mode—indeed, the only mode whose affective qualities are consistently described—which could drive listeners mad with the urge to take up arms and kill anyone within striking distance (Atlas 560).

Case characterizes the Lydian mode as "used in comedies, in former times, being more lighter and wanton than *Dorius*, answereth to that which I termed amorous and delightsome" (55). In contrast, Case describes the Mixolydian mode as follows: "*Myxolydius* most used in tragedies expressing in melodie those lamentable affections which are in tragedies represented, aunswereth to that which before I named Melancholike and dolefull" (55). While the Lydian would bring delight and wantonness to the soul, the Mixolydian would do the opposite, making the soul weighty, sad, and full of lamentation.

Descriptions of the Aeolian and the Ionian modes do not appear in many English treatises predating the first performance of *The Winter's Tale*, but the modes would have been known and generally accepted because they appear in Morley's *Plain and Easy Introduction*, the most popular music treatise in early modern England (Ortiz 105-06). John Playford's and Charles Butler's texts, published in the decades following Shakespeare's death, do discuss the therapeutic properties of the two modes in some detail. Playford, for example, describes the Aeolian mode as "allay[ing] the Passions, and charm[ing] the Affections into a sweet and pleasing temper; such as was that enchanting Musick of the Harp, provided for King *Saul*" (59; see also Butler 2).

The Ionian mode, according to Butler and Playford, has many similarities to the Aeolian, although while the Aeolian could send its listeners to sleep, the Ionian would awaken them. Playford explains: "The *Ionick Mood* was for more light and effeminate Musick, as pleasant *amorous Songs, Corants, Sarabands*, and *Jigs*, used for

honest mirth and delight at Feasts and other merriments. [...] The abuse of this *Mood* is soon reformed by the sober *Dorick*; for what this excites above moderation, the other draws into a true *Decorum*" (61; see also Butler 2, 4, 7). Clearly, the modes—the Dorian, the Phrygian, the Lydian, the Mixolydian, the Aeolian, and the Ionian, each with their plagal counterparts—generate different emotions, because of their distinct style and power, and thus music could be specifically chosen and tailored to suit and cure a particular malady or emotional disturbance in the hearers. Moreover, such a power of the modes is not limited to the Renaissance. Recently, Ian C. Straehley and Jeremy L. Loebach, using mathematical and statistical models, have demonstrated that "mode influences perceived emotion in consistent ways for more and less experienced participants beyond mere associations with Ionian and Aeolian [modes]" and "Interestingly, the frequencies of bipolar emotional sets assigned to the modes conform generally to historical interpretations of mode and emotion associations" (30).

116   The theory of modes explains what types of music will affect people in particular and unique ways, but none of these modes can resurrect a statue. But, couple the potential affective power of modes with what I term the Renaissance theory of healthful opposites, and you can choose, with some accuracy, the type of music that will cause the change you desire. Thomas Willis provides a useful summary of the effect of opposites in his *Practice of Physick*: "The affections of the mind being vehement, and stirred up from thence, are either to be appeased, or subdued by others opposite. Wherefore, to desperate Love ought to be applied or shewed indignation and hatred; Sadness is to be opposed with the flatteries of Pleasure, [...] In like manner, as to the rest of the Passions, you must proceed to quiet, or elude them" (193-94). In other words, if a patient is melancholic, joyful music can cure him/her; if a patient is enraged, a calming tune may soothe him/her. The music that can resurrect Hermione, according to these theories, must be in a mode that will cure—and hence be the opposite of—the cause of her death. Analyzing the possible modal quality of the final song of the play, therefore, necessitates a close reading of the diverse and complex reasons for Hermione's demise and the emotions that might be roused (or allayed) at her resurrection. Of course, as David Hoeniger writes in *Medicine and Shakespeare in the English Renaissance*, "the whole question of what kind of music was performed in these scenes must remain largely guesswork" (269). Hearteningly, this is after he has spent a few paragraphs describing the modes best suited to the musical cures in *Pericles* and *King Lear*.

The music of the final scene of the play, therefore, must repair the brokenness left at the end of Act III. In that Act, Mamillius, the young son of Hermione and Leontes, dies "with mere conceit and fear / Of the Queen's speed" (III.ii. 142-43). Mamillius dies of a broken heart, and his mother follows him soon after: "This news is mortal to the Queen: look down / And see what death is doing" (III.ii. 146-47), Paulina tells Leontes as soon as Mamillius's death is announced, and the dead or dying Hermione must be borne from the stage. Paulina soon returns to tell Leontes that Hermione has died, overcome by the loss of both her children. Hermione's death is occasioned by

her great sorrow; her mind and heart, overcome by pain and loss, causes the breakdown of her sympathetic body. Because she dies of grief, the music that resurrects her must counteract her sorrow. According to early modern English descriptions of modes, then, perhaps the best mode to resurrect her is the Lydian, which is, according to *The Praise of Musicke*, light and wanton. The Aeolian, with its soft and pleasing tones, would also be appropriate here, as would the Ionian, which has the added benefit of being a rousing mode designed to wake its listeners from sleep. Because she died in sorrow, the Lydian, Aeolian, or Ionian modes, potential counters to that sorrow, can resurrect her body at the end of the play.

A song in a light and cheerful mode may cure Hermione, but she is not the only one in the final scene to be cured. In *The Winter's Tale*, almost the entire cast witnesses the cure of Hermione and the music washes over the stage, affecting Paulina, Leontes, Polixenes, Camillo, Perdita, Florizel, the lords and attendants, and the theatre audience. Do all of these people need to be cured, and if so, what can cure the social and familial unrest caused by Leontes's jealousy and Hermione's death? **117** Certainly all of the characters—and the audience—remember the horror of the trial scene, the banishment of Perdita, and the death of Mamillius. The relationships broken by that scene reform when Hermione wakes to the sound of music; her cure is a catalyst for the healed relationship of herself and Leontes, the sanctioned romance of Perdita and Florizel, the renewed friendship of Leontes and Polixenes, and the planned marriage of Camillo and Paulina. The joy of those new or renewed relationships, as well as the upcoming celebrations of nuptial bliss, suggest particular modes: the Lydian, Aeolian, or Ionian again, used for their comedic, social restorative effects. Butler even specifically cites the Ionian as suitable for and often used at weddings (8). Not only are the onstage viewers united in their joy upon seeing Hermione alive again, they are also united in a classically comedic ending of social reparation and neat marriages.

The scene staged by Paulina in Act V, scene iii is for more than Hermione's resurrection or for social reconciliation: it is also the final element of Leontes's training and atonement. Paulina must first be sure that Leontes is heartily sorry for his groundless jealousy and that he has been thoroughly punished for and by his guilt. Leontes must not only believe in the innocence of his wife, but he must also believe Apollo, who via the Delphic Oracle proclaimed the virtue of Hermione and the eventual reunion of Perdita with her family. Such an effect on Leontes might be best advanced by the Dorian mode, which would move him to "godliness and sobriety," two attributes he is sorely lacking in the first three acts of the play. The Dorian mode would also emphasize the involvement of Apollo at this point, making the music not only curative, but also divine. A number of performances of the play have highlighted the importance of Apollo in the final scene, either by ending the play with a song to Apollo or to the gods, or by having Leontes exclaim "Heavenly Powers" during the music, immediately after Hermione first turns her head, and immediately before she steps off the pedestal (Bartholomeusz 32-33). If Hermione is resurrected by the Dorian

mode, her new life is one that is marked not only by social reconciliation, signalled by the Lydian, Aeolian, or Ionian modes, but also by divine or cosmic reconciliation. Leontes had offended Apollo by rejecting his oracle, but a song in the Dorian mode at the end of the play would bring Leontes back into favour with the god of music, poetry, and medicine.

But has Leontes learned to regard celestial Joys rather than earthly things? When he views the statue, he is enthralled by its physical characteristics. He notes its age, eyes, veins, and lips. Paulina is quite alarmed when he intends to kiss the funerary statue, and she threatens to close the curtain to hide Hermione from his view. How heavenly, then, are his thoughts in this final scene of the play? Hermione, when she awakens, would be justifiably angry with him—the man who caused not only her death, but also the death of her son and the banishment of her daughter—and who now seems more concerned with her body than with her soul. The Phrygian mode, played with trumpet, fife, or drum, would resurrect Hermione to anger, and indeed, in eighteenth-century productions of the play, Leontes would retreat fearfully before Hermione as she descended the pedestal. Although she embraces him, Hermione does not speak to Leontes, but only to Perdita, and she certainly does not call down any heavenly blessings upon him. If Hermione is resurrected to a song in the Phrygian mode, again the mode unites the first three acts of the play with the final two: although Perdita and Florizel are about to be happily wed, Leontes is still responsible for his dastardly actions of the first three acts. His family is (almost all) reunited, but he is not necessarily and immediately forgiven by the other characters.

Nearly all of the modes are appropriate curative music for Hermione in Act V, scene iii: the Lydian, Aeolian, or Ionian to resurrect Hermione from her melancholic death and to signal the social reconciliation at the end of the play, the Dorian to express Leontes's rehabilitation, or the Phrygian to rouse Hermione to righteous anger. The Myxolidian is the only mode that seems out of place here: nothing about Hermione's resurrection seems melancholic or doleful: all those present onstage are delighted—and perhaps trepidatious—at her safe rebirth. Such a multiplicity of answers to the question "what should the music in Act V, scene iii sound like?" testifies to the complexity of the play and the nuances of this scene. The final choice of music is at the discretion of the director, who may want to emphasize one element over another here at the end of the play. Indeed, evidence from prompt books and records of performances bears out the validity of a number of different musical conceptions of the final scene of the play.

The multiplicity of appropriate modes for the music in *The Winter's Tale* should be no surprise. Authors, playwrights, doctors, and theologians disagree wildly about the nature and use of music, and sometimes one person holds contradictory views, even in the same treatise, without any apparent concern. Debra Shuger even opines that "this complex 'changing of mind' belongs to the infrastructure of Renaissance discourse as much as do changes in social, economic, and political arrangements" (68). A quick search of musical and medical treatises from the period demonstrates

118

a similar contradiction: music can simultaneously cause, reveal, and cure melancholy, as Amanda Eubanks Winkler, Erin Minear, James Winn, Robin Headlam Wells, David Lindley, Katrine K. Wong, Katherine Butler, Hyun-Ah Kim, Leslie C. Dunn, and Katherine R. Larson have ably demonstrated. Joseph Ortiz even helpfully reminds his readers that music's meaning is "slippery" and "promiscuous" (66).

The promiscuity of music, and particularly musical modes, is all the more apparent when considering the transitional state of modes in Shakespearean England. Indeed, mode may affect mood, but were modes actually used in performance, particularly in England in the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries? P. Samuel Rubio argues that modes were disappearing by the sixteenth century, and modes were used more "in theory than in practice" (80). Likewise, Harold S. Powers calls modes "rather more cultural than technical" and "first and foremost a theoretical construct," and Claude Palisca is equally dismissive (Powers, "Tonal Types" 430; Powers "Is Mode Real" 174; Palisca 72). Bernhard Meier even opines that the affective nature of modes—their effect on mood—was already in doubt in the sixteenth century (385), but his evidence derives from continental sources rather than English ones. Tim Carter, however, responding to Powers and Palisca in particular, cautions: "For seventeenth-century music, issues of tonal structure are complex and have yet to be fully resolved" (170). After providing a complicated definition of modality and tonality, he warns, "If it is so hard to define 'pure' modality and 'pure' tonality, any transition between the two, if such there be, is doubly difficult to explain" (172). If I may use a contemporary example: even though email is available, people still write and send letters through the postal service. Modes may have been falling out of use in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, but they were by no means wholly defunct by the time Shakespeare was writing.

Yet although early modern English theorists describe the modes in detail in their treatises, they often seem uneasy about their relevance and accuracy. John Playford, for example, describes the modes using the past tense, and prefaces his explanation with a caveat: "These five [modes] appertained to the *Grecians* only" (57). Both Playford and Butler, however, belie the claim of irrelevancy or mere speculation or theory because they are both careful to include contemporary examples in their descriptions of the modes. Playford names fellow musicians Morley, Wilkes, Wilbey, and Ward when he characterizes the Aeolian mode (59). Butler's invocation of the modes at the beginning of his text seems more than merely a nod to theoretical or speculative music, for he concludes his chapter with this observation: "Skilful Musicians know hou to form any Moode in any Key or Tone indifferently: so it be conformable to the Air of the Subject" (2). Indeed, in his extensive annotations on his chapter on the modes, Butler provides detailed examples of English modal compositions: "Of the *Dorik* Moode ar the Psalms in Meeter: and all grave and honest songs: such as is, *Like to the Damask-rose we see*, - - - - &c. the Author wereof is Mr. F. *Quarles*: who has written many excellent Divine Poems. The whole booke of Psalms was lately set foorth in 4. Parts by Mr. *Thomas Ravenscroft*, composed by

John Farmer, Th. Morley, G. Kirby, [...] and sundry others" (4). Butler gives similar examples for the other modes, demonstrating their cultural and performative significance during his lifetime.

Morley seems dismissive of the modes, for he only writes extensively about them in the annotations to the third part of his treatise, omitting the theory of modes from the main text of his work. In his annotations on modes, however, Morley does not state or even imply that the modes are outmoded. His only complaint about his contemporaries' handling of the modes is one of (in)accuracy rather than (ir)relevance:

> It is also to be understood that those examples which I have in my book set down for the eight tunes be not the true essential forms of the eight tunes or usual Modes, but the forms of giving the tunes to their psalms in the churches which the churchmen (falsely) believe to be the *modi* or tunes, but if we consider them rightly they be all of some imperfect Mode, none of them filling the true compass of any Mode. (304)

The modes, he argues, have been incorrectly identified, implying that he considers modes relevant to early modern English musical composition; otherwise, why would he care about their "true compass"?

For the music of *The Winter's Tale*, modes in balladry are particularly significant. After including the usual warnings about the slipperiness of modes, Christopher Marsh explains how modes influenced ballad tunes. There existed, he posits, an "apparent predominance among ballad tunes of two old modes in particular: the Dorian (similar, though by no means identical, to our now familiar minor scale) and the Ionian (the originator of our major scale)" (*Music* 292). Marsh then turns to Charles Butler to explain the sound and effect of the two modes, the first of which was slow and solemn, and the second light and airy.

Ballads and their formative modes are essential to the music of V.iii. because of a single word in V.ii., one that critics such as Ross Duffin have noted. In that scene, the first gentleman calls the second gentleman, who is otherwise unnamed, "Rogero," the only time Shakespeare ever uses that name. Shakespeare's audiences, well versed in the popular music of the day, would have instantly recognized this word as the title of a well-known ballad tune, "Rogero," based on the Italian bass line, Ruggiero (Duffin, *Songbook* 345; Carr 23). The Oxford Shakespeare emphasizes the musical implications of the name in Act V, Scene ii by substituting "Ruggiero" for the more traditional "Rogero." Couple "What news, Rogero! (or, "What news, Ruggiero!") with the response: "Nothing but bonfires. The oracle is fulfilled. The King's Daughter is found. Such a deal of wonder is broken out within this hour, that ballad-makers cannot be able to express it" (V.ii. 22-25), and the reference to ballads and the specific ballad-tune, "Rogero," is unmistakeable.

"Rogero" was the bass line for a diverse range of titillating, gossipy, or morally-improving ballads such as "A comfortable new Ballad of a Dreame of a Sinner, being very troubled with the assaults of Sathan," "The Norfolk Gentleman his last VVill and Testament. / Who Committed the keeping of his Children to his own Brother, who dealt most wickedly with them, and / how God plagued him for it," and "A right

Godly and Christian A.B.C. shewing the duty of every degree." In his incredibly thorough *Shakespeare's Songbook*, Duffin has unearthed both the "Rogero" melody and bass line and a ballad that was set to it: "The Torment of a Jealous Mind" (342). The story of that ballad is remarkably similar to the first three acts of *The Winter's Tale*. In the ballad, a jealous old man groundlessly accuses his young wife of infidelity. She fears for her life if she does not (falsely) confess, and while appearing to forgive her, her husband plots her death. After killing her and her supposed lover, he commits a very public suicide, thus creating a cautionary tale about the hellishness of jealousy.

The tune and mode of the song is as essential here as its accompanying ballad. The melody, transcribed into the key of F major, is in the Ionian mode, a common mode used in ballads (Butler 8). This means that when the play triggers the audience's auditory memories in Act IV, Scene ii with the word "Rogero," a tune in the Ionian mode would have been flooding their minds. Although "Rogero" is the tune for any number of ballads, "The Torment of a Jealous Mind" has the most immediate and titillating correspondences to *The Winter's Tale*, a link that most audience members may have recognized, given the prevalence of ballad culture (Marsh, *Music* 225). If the first part of the play, especially Acts I-III, but continuing up to Act V, scene ii corresponds to "Rogero" and the ballad "The Torment of a Jealous Mind," audiences would have expected a similar ending: death, sadness, and penitence all around (Duffin, "Ballads" 37).

Instead, *The Winter's Tale* answers "Rogero" with another song, the song that resurrects Hermione. This therapeutic music, then, cures not only Hermione, Leontes, or the audience, but the story itself, told from Act I, scene i up to Act V, scene ii. Although his objections might seem too harsh in the context of the play, Charles Butler (in a paragraph marked by a manicule), adds a caution about ballads and particularly the Ionian mode: "All [Ballads and the Ionian mode] which surely, might and woolde bee more freely permitted by our Sages; were they used, as they owght, onely for health and recreation; and not corrupted, as they ar, with dangerous immodesti, and filthy obsceniti, to the offence of God and good folk, and to the hurt both of body and sowl" (8). "Rogero" and "The Torment of a Jealous Mind" have not offered health—indeed, quite the opposite: Mamillius, Antigonus, and Hermione have all been killed by its fatal consequences. In response to "Rogero," then, the play could offer a resurrecting song in an opposing mode. Although it is impossible to recreate accurately the music that plays in Act V, Scene iii, the evidence from the play and from early modern English music theory all point to one mode: The Ionian mode of "Rogero" would be answered appropriately in Act V, scene iii, by what Playford calls the "Dorick mode," which reforms the Ionian so that the ending of "The Torment of a Jealous Mind" and *The Winter's Tale* is moderated "into a true Decorum" (61).

The Dorian mode is also particularly suited to the resurrection scene when considering other textual cues in the scene. Text is vital for determining the nature of Renaissance music, for early modern music theorists (even if they were opposed at times by certain theologians and theatre critics) are firm and unequivocal on at least

one point: music and words must suit each other (Marsh, *Music* 391-94). As Thomas Morley directs in *A Plain and Easy Introduction*:

> Dispose your music according to the nature of the words which you are therein to express, as whatsoever matter it be which you have in hand such a kind of music must you frame to it. You must therefore, if you have a grave matter, apply a grave kind of music to it; if a merry subject you must make your music also merry, for it will be a great absurdity to use a sad harmony to a merry matter or a merry harmony to a sad, lamentable, or tragical ditty. (290)

Paulina's words when she calls for music have a remarkably slow, interrupted rhythm: "Music; awake her: strike: / 'Tis time: descend: be stone no more: approach: / Strike all that look upon with marvel: Come:" (V.iii. 98-100). Any music that accompanies the slow pace of Paulina's words should be correspondingly slow, to suit music to words. Again, that slow pace can be found in the Dorian mode, of which Charles Butler comments: "The *Dorik* Moode consisteth of sober slow-timed Notes […] the notes answering the number of the Syllables" (1). The slow tempo of Paulina's speech accompanying the music, the verb "strike" that suggests a command for viols (along with the later pun on "vials"), and the invocation of Apollo in the play all suggest the Dorian mode, played on the viola-da-gamba.

Since "Rogero" in Act V, scene ii raises the spectre of ballads, perhaps the music in V.iii. could have been a ballad tune as well. As Tiffany Stern has convincingly argued, written music was often one of the ephemeral materials of a play, and "Playwrights putting texts together at speed sometimes took whatever song was to hand, playing with its earlier meanings on some occasions, hoping to subsume them with new meanings on others. The result is that songs did not always belong as powerfully to a single play as did other aspects of the text: their potential to wander was inherent within their relationship to plays" (*Documents* 134). If Shakespeare or his theatre company were looking for an appropriate ballad for V.iii. in the Dorian mode, they would have had plenty of choice. Marsh points out that "the four most frequently cited melodies [of ballads]—'Fortune my Foe,' 'Packington's Pound,' 'Chevy Chase,' and 'O man in desperation'—all seem to have been in [the Dorian] mode" (Music 292).

The first ballad melody Marsh cites, "Fortune my Foe," seems particularly appropriate to *The Winter's Tale*, and especially to the final scene. He even calls "Fortune my Foe" a "super-tune" because of its remarkable popularity and ubiquity (Marsh, "'Fortune my Foe'"). Sarah F. Williams, in her extensive study of ballads, theatre, and "Fortune my Foe" in particular, confirms that the tune is, indeed, in the Dorian mode (66-67). Moreover, "Fortune" appears ten times in the play, and surely Leontes and his family have experienced fortune as their foe. Autolycus complains, "I see Fortune would not suffer me," for instance, and Florizel calls "fortune, visible an Enemy" (IV. iv. 832-33; V.i. 215). Shakespeare clearly knew the title of the tune specifically, for in *The Merry Wives of Windsor*, Falstaff uses the phrase, "Fortune, thy foe" (III.iii. 60). About this reference in *The Merry Wives*, Duffin writes baldly, "Shakespeare's refer-

ence to the highly popular *Fortune my Foe* ballad seems explicit enough" (*Songbook* 154). The title of the tune is significant, as are the titles of other ballad tunes, Williams argues: "The broadside trade could add layers of meaning to a simple melody through […] the title of the tune itself" (71).

And yet, paradoxically, the music in V.iii. brings about the reversal of fortune: Hermione is alive, Perdita is found, and the family is reunited. If "Fortune my Foe" were indeed the tune of the music in V.iii., the pun invoked by the tune and its title is remarkable: First, as soon as the audience hears "Fortune my Foe," Hermione "awakens," and fortune is no longer her foe. The pun intensifies if Paulina sings her words to the ballad tune. The ballad tune may have played solely on viols, but there is no reason to think that Paulina would not have sung her words to the Dorian melody of "Fortune my Foe." Simon Smith points out that 'music' "does not rule out song" (380).

The tune would have created certain expectations in the audience, Williams contends: "As the tune indication on broadsides throughout the late sixteenth and **123** seventeenth centuries with texts describing the supernatural, criminals, witchcraft trials, and murderers, the tune criminalized witchcraft, demonized domestic scolds, and, towards the end of the century, feminized criminals" (67). Whether or not Paulina sang the tune, she invokes the music, and if the tune is "Fortune my Foe," her punning is clever indeed: Leontes had called Paulina "A mankind witch" before the trial of Hermione (II.iii. 68), and surely her speech had been audacious and scolding in the play. Diane M. Dixon notes that "such powerful outspoken women [as Paulina] have been vulnerable though the centuries to the accusation of witchcraft" (39); in *Art and Illusion in The Winter's Tale*, B.J. Sokol situates her in the history of English witchcraft (153-57); and Leontes clearly fears Paulina's powerful and even magical speech. If Paulina were to sing her restorative words to the tune of "Fortune my Foe," she is acknowledging, mocking, and belying the claim that she is a witch. Just before the music of the scene, she has warned her audience that "you'll think / […] I am assisted / By wicked powers" (V.iii. 89-91), and, "Those that think it is unlawful business / I am about, let them depart" (V.iii. 96-97). After winning Leontes's approbation with "Proceed" (V.iii. 97), she then sings a song in the very tune that would normally associate her with witchcraft, criminality, and offenses against God. If she concludes the play with "Fortune my Foe," a ballad in the Dorian mode, Paulina has the last laugh as she once again overthrows expectations.

Of course, like all critics who have come before me, I must caution again that my conjectures about the sound of the music in V.iii. are just that: guesses. Yet I, and others involved in recovering "original practices," may be encouraged by a recent article by Gina Bloom, in which she compares the historicist to a gamer: "What might be gained by recognizing that historicist readings of Shakespeare are necessarily speculative. A good place to start is by recalling the gaming resonances of the term 'speculation.' In the context of gaming, the risks of speculation are central to the pleasures of play and crucial to reaping rewards from it" (224). By speculating

about the aural nature of the music in Act V, scene iii of *The Winter's Tale*, literary critics and musicologists can reconsider the role and significance of musical modes in performance and literature, and the effects of those modes on mood and the body. Speculating about the tune of the music also reveals a possible and complex pun at the end of the play, wherein the audience's expectations are overthrown and even mocked by the clever and audacious Paulina. The play ends not with "Rogero" and "The Torment of the Jealous Mind," but with "Fortune my Foe." Yet even that ballad defies expectations: it brings about the reversal of fortune, and the woman who sings the often "deviant" song has already won the audience's agreement that she cannot be a witch, or even unlawful.

Note

Works Cited

Atlas, Allan W. *Renaissance Music: Music in Western Europe, 1400-1600*. Norton, 1998.

Bartholomeusz, Dennis. *The Winter's Tale in Performance in England and America 1611-1976*. Cambridge UP, 1982.

Bloom, Gina. "The Historicist as Gamer." *Shakespeare in Our Time: A Shakespeare Association of America Collection*, edited by Dympna Callaghan and Suzanne Gossett, Bloomsbury, 2016, pp. 223-27.

Boethius, Anicius Manlius Severinus. *Fundamentals of Music*. Edited by Claude V. Palisca, translated by Calvin M. Bower, Yale UP, 1989.

Butler, Charles. *The Principles of Musik, in Singing and Setting: With the two-fold Use therof, [Ecclesiasticall and Civil]*. 1636. Da Capo P, 1970.

Butler, Katherine. *Music in Elizabethan Court Politics*. The Boydell P, 2015.

Carr, James Revell. ""An Harmlesse Dittie": Ballad Music and its Sources." *Broadside Ballads from the Pepys Collection: A Selection of Texts, Approaches, and Recordings*, edited by Patricia Fumerton, Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 2012, pp. 21-24.

Carter, Tim. "The Search for Musical Meaning." *The Cambridge History of Seventeenth-Century Music*, edited by Tim Carter and John Butt, Cambridge UP, 2005, pp. 158-96.

Case [?], John. *The Praise of Musicke*. 1586. Reprinted in the Anglistica and

Americana series, Georg Olms Verlag, 1980.

"A comfortable new Ballad of a Dreame of a Sinner, being very sore troubled with the assaults of Sathan." Printed for E. Wright, 1625[?], Magdalene College Pepys 1.39, EBBA 20025, accessed 17 June 2016, http://ebba.english.ucsb.edu/ballad/20025/image

Dixon, Diane. ""Away With That Audacious Lady": Paulina's Rhetoric in *The Winter's Tale*." *Journal of the Wooden O Symposium*, vol. 4, 2004, pp. 35-44.

Duffin, Ross W. "Ballads in Shakespeare's World." *"Noyses, Sounds, and Sweet Aires": Music in Early Modern England*, edited by Jessie Ann Owens, Folger Shakespeare Library, 2006, pp. 32-47.

---. *Shakespeare's Songbook*. Norton, 2004. Print.

Dunn, Leslie C., and Katherine R. Larson, editors. *Gender and Song in Early Modern England*. Ashgate, 2014.

Headlam Wells, Robin. *Elizabethan Mythologies: Studies in Poetry, Drama and Music*. Cambridge UP, 1994.

Hoeniger, F. David. *Medicine and Shakespeare in the English Renaissance*. U of Delaware P, 1992.

Kim, Hyun-Ah. *The Renaissance Ethics of Music*. Pickering & Chatto, 2015.

Long, John H. *Shakespeare's Use of Music: The Final Comedies*. U of Florida P, 1961.

Lindley, David. *Shakespeare and Music*. Arden Shakespeare, 2007.

Lyne, Raphael. *Shakespeare's Late Work*. Oxford UP, 2007.

Marsh, Christopher. "'Fortune my Foe': The Circulation of an English Super-Tune." *Identity, Intertextuality, and Performance in Early Modern Song Culture*, edited by Dieuwke van der Poel, Louis Peter Grijp, and Wim van Anrooij, Brill, 2016, pp. 308-30.

---. *Music and Society in Early Modern England*. Cambridge UP, 2010.

Mead, Sarah. "Renaissance Theory." *A Performer's Guide to Renaissance Music*, 2nd edition, edited by Jeffery Kite-Powell, Indiana UP, 2007.

Meier, Bernhard. *The Modes of Classical Vocal Polyphony, Described According to the Sources, With Revisions by the Author*. Translated by Ellen S. Beebe, Broude Brothers Limited, 1988.

Minear, Erin. *Reverberating Song in Shakespeare and Milton: Language, Memory, and Musical Representation*. Ashgate, 2011.

Morley, Thomas. *A Plain and Easy Introduction to Practical Music, Second Edition*. 1597. Edited by R. Alec Harman, Norton, 1973.

"A most Godly and Comfortable Ballad of the Glorious / Resurrection of our Lord Iesus Christ, how he Triumphed over Death, and Hell and Sin, / whereby we are

certainly perswaded of our Rising again from the Dead." Printed for J. Clarke, W Thackery, and T. Passinger, 1684-86, Magdalene College Pepys 2.20-21, EBBA 20645, accessed 17 June 2016, http://ebba.english.ucsb.edu/ballad/20645/image

"The Norfolk Gentleman his last VVill and Testament. / Who Committed the keeping of his Children to his own Brother, who dealt most wickedly with them, and / how God plagued him for it." Printed for W Thackery, and T. Passinger, 1686-88, Magdalene College Pepys 1.518-519, EBBA 20246, accessed 17 June 2016, http://ebba.english.ucsb.edu/ballad/20246/image.

Ortiz, Joseph M. *Broken Harmony: Shakespeare and the Politics of Music*. Cornell UP, 2011.

Palisca, Claude. *Music and Ideas in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries*. U of Illinois P, 2006.

Perkins, Leeman L. *Music in the Age of the Renaissance*. Norton, 1999.

Playford, John. *An Introduction to the Skill of Musick, Seventh Edition*. 1674. Gregg P, 1966.

Powers, Harold. "Is Mode Real? Pietro Aron, the Octenary System, and Polyphony." *Basler Jahrbuch für historische Musikpraxis*, vol. 16, 1992, pp. 9-52; reprinted in *Musical Theory in the Renaissance*, edited by Cristle Collins Judd, Ashgate, 2013, pp. 169-212.

---. "Tonal Types and Modal Categories in Renaissance Polyphony." *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, vol. 34, no. 3, 1981, pp. 428-70.

"A right Godly and Christian A.B.C. shewing the duty of every degree." Printed for Henry Gosson, 1601-40[?], British Library Roxburghe 1.492, EBBA 30328, accessed 17 June 2016, http://ebba.english.ucsb.edu/ballad/30328/image

Rowe, Nicholas, editor. *The Works of Mr. William Shakespeare, Volume 2*. Printed for Jacob Tonson, 1709.

Rubio, P. Samuel. *Classical Polyphony*. Translated by Thomas Rive, Basil Blackwell, 1972.

Scott, Ch. Kennedy. *Madrigal Singing: A Few Remarks on the Study of Madrigal Music with an explanation of the Modes and a Note on their Relation to Polyphony*. Greenwood P, 1970.

Shakespeare, William. *The Merry Wives of Windsor. The Oxford Shakespeare: The Complete Works*, 2nd edition, edited by John Jowett et al., Clarendon P, 2005, pp. 511-36.

---. *Pericles. The Oxford Shakespeare: The Complete Works*, 2nd edition, edited by John Jowett et al., Clarendon P, 2005, pp. 1063-86.

---. *The Winter's Tale. The Oxford Shakespeare: The Complete Works*, 2nd edition, edited by John Jowett et al., Clarendon P, 2005, pp. 1125-52.

---. *The Winter's Tale*, edited by John Pitcher, Arden Shakespeare, Bloomsbury, 2014.

Shuger, Debora. *Habits of Thought in the English Renaissance: Religion, Politics, and the Dominant Culture*. U of California P, 1990.

Smith, Simon. "'Pleasing Strains': The Dramaturgical Role of Music in *The Winter's Tale*." *Shakespeare Survey*, vol. 67, 2014, pp. 372-83.

Sokol, B.J. *Art and Illusion in The Winter's Tale*. Manchester UP, 1994.

---. "Cerimon's 'Rough and Woeful Music' in Pericles." *Shakespeare*, vol. 10, no. 1, 2014, pp. 46-55.

Stern, Tiffany. *Documents of Performance in Early Modern England*. Cambridge UP, 2009.

---. "New Directions: Inverted Commas around the 'Fun': Music in *Twelfth Night*." *Twelfth Night: A Critical Reader*, edited by Alison Findlay and Liz Oakley-Brown, Bloomsbury, 2014, pp. 166-88.

Straehley, Ian C., and Jeremy L. Loebach. "The Influence of Mode and Musical Experience on the Attribution of Emotions to Melodic Sequences." *Psychomusicology: Music, Mind, and Brain*, vol. 24, no. 1, 2014, pp. 21-34.

Taruskin, Richard. *Music from the Earliest Notations to the Sixteenth Century*. The Oxford History of Western Music, Oxford UP, 2010.

Williams, Sarah F. *Damnable Practises: Witches, Dangerous Women, and Music in Seventeenth-Century English Broadside Ballads*. Ashgate, 2015.

Wilson, Christopher R., and Michela Calore. *Music in Shakespeare: A Dictionary*. Bloomsbury, 2014.

Winkler, Amanda Eubanks. *O Let Us Howle Some Heavy Note: Music for Witches, the Melancholic, and the Mad on the Seventeenth-Century English Stage*. Indiana UP, 2006.

Winn, James. *Unsuspected Eloquence: A History of the Relations Between Poetry and Music*. Yale UP, 1981.

Wong, Katrine K. *Music and Gender in English Renaissance Drama*. Routledge, 2013.

"A worthy mirror, wherein you may marke, / an excellent discourse of a breeding Larke: / By reading whereof, perceiue well you may, / what truth is in friends or in kinsfolke to stay." Printed for I.W., 1602-46[?], British Library Roxburghe 1.464-465, EBBA 30312, accessed 17 June 2016, http://ebba.english.ucsb.edu/ballad/30312/image.

127