

## **Persistence of Ethnicity and Inequality Among Canadian Immigrants**

**Madeline A. Kalbach  
Warren E. Kalbach**

Department of Sociology  
University of Calgary

---

### ***Abstract***

1991 Census data support earlier findings that immigrants who indicate some degree of 'ethnic-connectedness' are more likely to be disadvantaged with regard to education and economic achievement in a secular society than the less ethnically connected individuals. The analysis also supports earlier findings that regardless of origin, those immigrating to Canada when relatively young have acculturated more readily and achieved higher educational and economic status than those arriving as teenagers; and within any ethnic origin group, being more ethnic is still negatively associated with educational achievement and economic success. Similar findings were found for those immigrating to Canada since 1981.

### ***Résumé***

Les données du recensement de 1991 appuient des résultats antérieurs suggérant que les immigrants rapportant une certaine appartenance ethnique tendent à être plus désavantagés en matière d'éducation et sur le plan économique dans une société séculaire. L'analyse soutient aussi d'autres observations indiquant que, quelles que soient leurs origines, les personnes qui ont immigré au Canada relativement jeunes font l'objet d'une acculturation plus aisée et accèdent à un statut éducatif et économique plus élevé que les personnes qui immigrèrent à l'adolescence; et que, au sein de tout groupe ethnique, un degré élevé d'appartenance reste négativement associé au niveau de scolarisation et au succès économique. Des résultats semblables ont été relevés pour les personnes ayant immigré au Canada depuis 1981.

**Key words:** ethnic origin, economic achievement, assimilation, Canada

## **Introduction**

A landmark change in immigration regulations occurred in 1962 in response to growing objections in the late 1950s to restrictions on non-white immigration. The regulations were amended to state that "anyone regardless of origin, citizenship, country of residence, or religious belief, who is personally qualified by reason of education, training, skills or other special qualifications" was eligible to apply for permanent residence in Canada (Canada Year Book, 1965:205). The implications of this change for the future ethnic composition of Canada were enormous (Richard, 1991).

As late as 1951, nine of the top ten source countries of immigrants to Canada were European and the tenth was the United States. By 1968 Hong Kong became one of the top ten sources of immigrants and by 1992 the number of non-European major source countries had increased to 8 of the top 10. These changes in the character of the immigrant stream have implications for settlement patterns, the spatial distribution of ethnic groups, cultural differences between ethnic groups and their economic and social integration in Canada on into the twenty-first century.

Canadian immigration policy will continue to be non-discriminatory and the major source countries of immigration are also likely to continue to be non-European. Ethnic diversity is likely to be a continuing phenomenon in Canadian society inspite of the possible lowering of yearly quotas and the implementation of fees for the privilege of being considered for immigration to Canada. Immigration quotas in the early nineties, for example, ranged between 214,000 in 1990 to 252,000 in 1994. By 1997 the quota had been reduced to 195,000-220,000. In addition, the costs of immigration and processing normally borne by the Canadian taxpayer have now shifted to prospective immigrants. This was accomplished by the institution of a non-refundable right of landing fee of \$975, as well as processing fees ranging from \$125.00 for an employment authorization to \$500 for landed immigrant status from within by refugees and live-in caregivers (Citizenship and Immigration Canada). Therefore, even though there may be some adjustments in the numbers of immigrants being let in to Canada, it is likely that the diversity of Canadian society will continue to increase well into the twenty-first century.

A persistent question in immigration research in Canada concerns the significance of the immigrant's ethnic and cultural origins for successful integration into Canadian Society. More specifically, the question that arises is "To what extent does the individual's ethnic identity or degree of ethnic-connectedness serve to facilitate or impede his or her degree of social mobility and socio-economic achievement?" Considerable research by the authors on Canadian data has continued to support the often stated relationship that as use or knowledge of the ethnic language declines, socioeconomic integration

improves over time, both within and between generations (Kalbach and Richard, 1995, 1991a, 1991b, 1990, 1988, 1985, 1980). This finding is totally consistent with general assimilation theory and testable hypotheses re assimilation and cultural persistence arising from the work of Gordon (1964), Lieberman (1963) and others (Richmond and Kalbach, 1980; Breton, et.al., 1990; Isajiw, Sev'er and Driedger, 1993; Boyd, et.al, 1985).

The major changes in immigration practices and regulations beginning during the 1960s has produced a dramatic shift in emmigration streams from European to non-European source countries and in the soci-economic and cultural characteristics of the arriving immigrants. The purpose of this paper is basically to report the results of a replication of earleir crosstabular analyses of census data to determine the extent to which the pattern of social and economic integration exhibited at the time of the 1971 and 1981 censuses still hold, circa 1991, for Canada's more recent and predominantly non-European immigrant groups. More specifically, variations in linguistic assimilation and social and economic status attainment are examined for the native born (second-plus generation) and for the foreign born (first generation) by age at immigration for the various ethno-religious subgroups of a selected number of major ethnic ancestry populations residing in Canada.

## **Literature Review**

Earlier research, based on exclusively on census data, has demonstrated the utility of employing a multidimensional definition of ethnicity (Richard, 1991; Kalbach and Richard, 1991a, 1991b, 1990, 1988, 1985a, 1985b, 1980; Kalbach and Kalbach, 1995). These studies took the basic multidimensional nature of ethno-cultural groups and variations in the heterogeneity of the religious variable into account by identifying and disaggregating their ethno-religious components for separate analysis. Kalbach and Richard, for example, have been investigating the relationship between ethno-religious identity and socioeconomic attainment of selected minority groups in Canada (*Ibid.*). Analyses of data from the 1971 and 1981 censuses indicated that many non-British European origin groups such as Germans and Ukrainians, who relinquished their identification with their traditional ethno-religious group by affiliating with the dominant Anglican and United Canadian churches exhibited greater language assimilation and higher socio-economic status than those who have continued to identify with their ethnic church. Furthermore, those who indicated no religious preference exhibited an even higher level of socio-economic achievement. These results suggest that of three possible pathways to cultural assimilation and economic integration, maintaining a greater degree of ethnic connectedness through identification with an ethnic church is the greatest inhibitor of social and economic mobility, while the secular pathway, with less ethnic connectedness, has been the better facilitator of mobility. Analyses of these data for both foreign- and native-born individuals have revealed that the significance of "ethnic connectedness" appears to have been the greatest for the foreign born, or first generation.

Age at immigration has been shown to exert both a strong effect on social and economic mobility (Kalbach and Richard, 1985b; Kalbach and Kalbach, 1995; Boyd, 1985; Inbar, 1977) and a negligible effect (Jones, 1987). Boyd's analysis, for example, revealed that foreign-born males who came to Canada prior to the age of seventeen exhibited an educational and occupational advantage over those who were older when they emigrated to Canada. Similar results were found by Kalbach and Richard (1995; 1985b) in terms of education and income. Jones' research (1987), on the other hand, indicated that when age at immigration was added to the status attainment model it added little to the explained variation in occupational mobility.

In addition, earlier research by Kalbach and Richard (1985b) has shown that a negative relationship between age at immigration and the use of English or French in the home held for all periods of immigration at the time of the 1981 Census for non-British and non-French European ethnic groups. In addition, it was shown that the proportions using English as a home language increased consistently for each age at immigration category as length of residence (reflected in period of immigration) increased. Those who came as children, and had been in Canada the longest, had the highest percentage using English as their home language; and those who were older when they arrived and had lived here for the shortest period of time (five years or less) were the least acculturated with respect to their language behaviour.

In spite of variations in the effects of age at immigration on social and economic mobility, as indicated in previous research, there is general agreement in the literature that the younger children are when they emigrated, the better their chances of mobility would be (Inbar, 1977). Generally speaking, age at immigration was found to exert some effect on specific ethno-religious groups as well as on immigrants as a whole.

Educational and economic achievement profiles of the second generation revealed in analyses of the 1971 Census data by Richmond and Kalbach (1980), raised questions regarding the related performance and achievement levels of the first generation foreign-born who had arrived in Canada as children. Since the 1981 Census, data on the age at immigration of the foreign-born population has been available making it possible to examine variation in the integrative and assimilative experience of the foreign born. As previously indicated, one would expect that those who had experienced the socialization effects of formal education and peer group pressures in Canada as children would become much more like their native-born counterparts than the older members of their own particular ethnic origin immigrant group with whom they have always been grouped for analysis. Furthermore, the logic of the "assimilation" model suggests that adults, who have arrived in Canada as young children, would be more like their native-born counterparts than the foreign born, with respect to their educational attainment and economic status. While the results of much of our previous research has been consistent with the general assimilation model, the changing character of Canada's immigrants and Canada's immigration policies warrants a continuing examination of this question as new data become available. This analysis treats "assimilation" as a natural interactive process

which occurs when culturally dominant and minority groups come into contact with each other. There are no assumptions regarding the inevitability of total assimilation of minority groups by the culturally dominant group. The objective of our research has been, and continues to be, to determine the significance of variations in "ethnic connectedness", i.e., cultural persistence, within ethnic origin groups for the integration and socioeconomic achievement of Canada's ethnically diverse population.

## **Data Source and Variable Definitions**

The principal data source for this analysis is the individual file of the Public Use Microdata File based on the 1991 Census of Canada. The specific variables used to operationally define the various social, cultural and economic concepts employed in this analysis are limited to the standard census variables as defined in the 1991 Census Dictionary (Statistics Canada, 1992).

The major difference of our analysis from most other research investigating the significance of ethnicity for differences in the integration and assimilation of minority groups is that our major unit for analysis is defined in terms of *ethnic origin* and *religion* rather than just ethnic origin by itself as has been the general practice in the past. It is important to point out that this has been the case, not necessarily through the lack of theoretical insight of previous researchers, so much as the lack of easy and relatively inexpensive access to more complicated special cross-tabulations of census data for "ethnoreligious" groups.

Furthermore, the ethnoreligious groups have been further disaggregated by place of birth in order to assess the degree of intergenerational integration and assimilation as well as intragenerational change between ethnoreligious groups within each of the broader ethnic origin categories. Earlier research, based on the 1971 Census, was able to distinguish between first, second and third-plus generations; but, this analysis is limited to just the first generation of foreign born and subsequent generations of native born as the "birthplace of parents" question was dropped after the 1971 Census of Canada.

This omission has been partly compensated for by a contrived "age at immigration" variable, constructed from information on "year of immigration" and "date of birth". Available since the 1981 Census, "age at immigration" can identify the younger foreign-born children of immigrants who would have received most of their education and early socialization experiences in Canada, like the cohort of children born to immigrants after arriving in Canada.

Much of the research on the integration and acculturation of immigrants into Canadian society has focused on the language behaviour of Allophones. In this analysis, language use in the home is used both as an index of acculturation, i.e., language assimilation, and, or index of "ethnic connectedness", the underlying assumption being that individual's using an ethnic language in the

home are more "ethnically connected" than those using one of the "official languages in a primary group situation.

Three measures of socioeconomic status achievement are used to examine the relationship between socioeconomic status and "ethnic connectedness" in terms of ethnoreligious identity or use of ethnic languages in the home. They are (1) the percentage reporting family incomes of \$50,000 or more, (2) the percentage reporting some university or degree; and, (3) the percentage of an ethnoreligious group (15 years of age and over) reporting managerial or professional occupations.

## Conceptual Framework and Methodology

Previous research on the significance of the individual's ethnic origin for integration and assimilation has been handicapped to a great extent because of the ambiguity surrounding the definition and meaning of such terms as ethnic identity, ethnic origin, and nationality. Ryder (1955) was one of the first to point out the validity and reliability problems associated with the census variable "ethnic origin" defined in terms of ethnic ancestry. Additional problems have arisen due to the difficulty of employing such concepts in a manner consistent with their theoretical conceptualization as a multidimensional phenomenon. Gordon's definition of ethnicity as a multidimensional phenomenon (1964) has been accepted for some time (Darroch and Marston, 1969; Yinger, 1985; Richard, 1991). Moreover, it has been argued convincingly for some time that it is pointless to treat ethnicity and religion as separate independent variables when in fact they are inseparable and intertwined (Porter, 1965:100; Greeley, 1971; Kornacker, 1971:152; Richard, 1991). Hence, *this research is innovative for census based research* in that it uses a multidimensional definition of ethnicity, i.e., ethnic origin and religion, as an *index of ethnic-connectedness* or ethnic identity rather than just "ethnic origin" or "place of birth" questions generally used in census based research in the past, neither of which have ever provided a very valid indicator or measure of an individual's current identity. It is recognized, however, that the religion variable has limitations in that it is only a rough indicator of some kind of an affiliation with an ethnic church without specifying the particular degree of religious commitment involved.

It is hypothesized that any indication of a traditional ethnic church affiliation will tend to reflect a greater ethnic-connectedness on the part of the individual than would be the case for either a major Canadian church affiliation or no expressed religious preference. Evidence of this greater ethnic-connectedness among Allophones can be found where ethnic languages are still mostly in the home. Thus, the strength of ethnic identity or ethnic-connectedness which may be said to characterize individuals of a particular ethno-religious group, can be roughly measured in terms of the proportions of ethno-religious groups reporting the use of ethnic languages in the home. While this procedure would obviously not be very useful for predominately English speaking ethnoreligious groups, the

few who still mostly used non-English ethnic languages in the home would still be identified as being more ethnically connected than those who did not.

It has also been hypothesized that the younger the foreign-born population was at the time of their immigration to Canada, the greater the congruence of their characteristics with those of their native-born counterparts. The younger immigrants will have experienced greater acculturation and economic integration than those who arrived in Canada as teenagers because of their longer exposure to school and peer groups. Given the generally shorter exposure of teenage immigrants to the same socialization influences, they would likely be further impaired by the earlier entry into the labour force generally required by immigrant families to provide additional support during the initial and often difficult period of settlement.

The migration process would appear to be more disruptive for teenage immigrants than for younger children, i.e., under 12 years of age. As a consequence, one would expect to see evidence of greater acculturation with respect to language use among the youngest immigrants as well as evidence of a more successful social and economic integration over the long term. On the other hand, teenage immigrants would more likely experience more rapid economic integration but suffer some competitive disadvantage in the long run because of their somewhat lower levels of acculturation, as reflected in their language skills, and possible disruption or termination of their formal education.

The following analysis explores the variations in ethnic-connectedness between ethno-religious groups using language in the home as a measure of ethnic group identity to demonstrate the greater ethnic commitment of those with ethnic church affiliations. The analysis then examines the relationship between age at immigration, period of immigration, acculturation in terms of declining ethnic commitment, and their social and economic status achievement.

### **Ethnic Church and Ethnic-Connectedness**

To show the relationship between ethnic church identity and ethnic-connectedness, percent of the population with ethnic language spoken in the home is shown for selected ethno-religious groups by nativity and age at immigration for the foreign born in Table 1. Based on the 1991 Census, these data are generally consistent with the earlier analyses of the 1981 Census and the hypothesis of a greater ethnic commitment on the part of those identifying with the more traditional ethnic religions. For the seven origin groups shown, the proportion of traditional ethnoreligious groups using ethnic languages in the home exceeded any of those identifying with major Canadian denominations or for those reporting no religion. Nineteen per cent of German Lutherans, Mennonites and Hutterites combined, for example, reported the use of non-official languages in the home compared to only 0.7 and 1.4 percent of those identifying with two of the major Canadian churches, e.g., the Anglican and United Church, respectively and 5.3 per cent of those reporting no religious

**Table 1. Per Cent of the Population 15 Years of Age and Over with Ethnic Language Spoken in the Home for Selected Ethno-Religious Groups by Nativity and Age at Immigration for the Foreign Born, Canada: 1991**

Ethno-Religious Group	Total Population	Native Born	Foreign Born				Total N
			Age at Immigration				
			Total	0-14	15-19	20+	
German	10.6	4.7	23.0	9.0	18.4	28.6	808,399
Luth/Menn/Hutt	18.6	12.2	30.2	15.1	22.5	37.0	277,500
Roman Catholic	8.5	0.8	25.8	6.6	17.9	33.0	193,300
Anglican	0.7	0.0	1.6	0.0	0.0	1.9	25,500
United Church	1.4	0.5	5.5	0.9	11.1	6.8	73,300
Other Protestant	8.2	2.5	21.6	7.5	20.0	27.5	9,100
No Religious Preference	5.3	0.8	16.0	5.4	9.0	23.0	95,333
Ukrainian	12.1	5.5	52.6	20.2	52.6	71.4	375,700
Ukrainian Catholic	26.3	12.6	67.4	32.4	66.0	79.5	84,667
Eastern Orthodox	19.3	10.8	55.4	23.0	67.6	74.5	73,967
Roman Catholic	6.3	2.7	36.7	11.5	26.1	57.4	77,700
Anglican	1.2	1.2	0.0	0.0	-	0.0	11,100
United Church	1.7	1.3	12.2	4.2	25.0	23.1	41,933
No Religious Preference	2.4	0.7	25.3	10.4	15.4	53.3	44,467
Portuguese	61.7	28.9	68.3	39.0	60.0	81.8	192,600
Roman Catholic	62.3	29.7	68.8	39.5	60.4	82.3	182,400
Other Protestant	57.1	10.5	65.4	40.6	50.0	76.7	4,200
No Religious Preference	43.2	31.3	47.3	25.0	40.0	62.7	4,167
Arab	55.5	13.6	61.6	41.7	60.9	64.5	107,400
Eastern Non-Christian	63.9	34.9	66.2	53.3	65.0	67.7	38,867
Eastern Orthodox	59.3	14.0	67.2	40.6	59.4	72.7	22,467
Roman Catholic	46.0	4.4	54.2	37.4	59.1	56.5	31,767
Other Protestant	61.2	16.7	64.8	39.1	66.7	68.0	7,900
No Religious Preference	24.3	0.0	32.1	0.0	50.0	36.4	2,467
South Asian	55.4	22.4	57.9	34.4	60.6	62.2	314,400
Eastern Non-Christian	64.5	31.5	66.6	43.1	68.4	70.7	256,933
Roman Catholic	12.9	0.0	14.0	1.6	9.3	17.8	24,533
Anglican	7.9	0.0	9.0	0.0	0.0	10.7	3,800
Other Protestant	17.7	5.4	19.2	3.8	22.7	22.5	11,133
No Religious Preference	19.3	2.2	23.6	10.7	21.4	31.6	7,600
Chinese	74.2	19.5	81.3	56.0	81.5	86.1	454,433
Eastern Non-Christian	89.1	37.2	90.4	81.3	88.8	92.2	58,233
Roman Catholic	62.5	17.5	67.0	45.0	61.8	71.7	60,567
Anglican	39.5	13.3	43.9	18.8	41.2	50.4	7,000
United Church	39.7	7.5	68.5	35.3	73.7	79.2	9,400
Baptist	72.8	27.3	77.1	45.1	88.6	81.6	12,867
Other Protestant	64.9	11.3	72.7	42.2	78.9	77.4	35,033
No Religious Preference	77.9	21.9	85.6	58.1	85.5	90.8	259,900
Other Eastern and South Eastern Asian	54.4	10.9	72.5	45.5	75.2	77.8	106,500
Eastern Non-Christian	66.1	24.8	77.9	68.7	81.6	79.1	31,333
Roman Catholic	62.5	4.4	70.4	39.7	69.0	77.9	12,533
United Church	24.8	6.5	70.2	37.5	88.9	75.4	10,867
Other Protestant	65.8	12.7	77.0	55.3	70.4	81.3	12,100
No Religious Preference	46.1	6.1	65.6	35.5	74.3	70.7	24,800

Source: Statistics Canada, 1991 Census of Canada. Public Use Microdata File, Individual File.



preference. The differences are greatest for the older established immigrant groups, i.e., Germans and Ukrainians, even though they show considerably lower levels of ethnic language use in the home at the time of the 1991 Census compared to the other more recent immigrant groups. Within each of the seven ethnic origin populations the more traditional ethno-religious groups reported higher proportions using ethnic languages in the home than was the case for any of the major Canadian churches; but, the differences between the traditional ethno-religious groups and those identifying with the more Canadian churches, or reporting no religious preference, tended to be somewhat less for the more recent arrivals than for the older and more established groups such as the Germans and Ukrainians.

Previously, it had been thought that those claiming no religious preference would be the most secularized and least ethnically connected regardless of their stated origins (Kalbach and Richard, 1985b). However, as may be seen in Table 1, of the seven groups examined this appears to be true only for the Portuguese and Arab origin groups. It would appear that for the other European and non-European origin groups, those reporting no religious preference tend to be in an intermediate position between their ethnic and Canadian church counterparts with respect to their degree of ethnic-connectedness rather than in an even more secularized position than that represented by the major Canadian Protestant churches. Clearly there may be some cultural ambiguity in the meaning of the "no religious preference" response for those of different cultural origins that muddies the interpretation of these data. The implication of this may be that in the process of acculturation and secularization, disaffiliation from one's traditional church, rather than religious conversion may be the assimilative path of least resistance.

As one would expect, comparisons between the native- and foreign-born generations of the ethno-religious populations, also shown in Table 1, indicate that the longer established groups show the greatest generational decline in the use of their ethnic languages in the home. Germans and Ukrainians, for example, show declines of 80 and 90 per cent respectively compared to only 58 per cent for the Portuguese and declines varying between 32 and 60 per cent for the other more recent ethnic groups.

The percentage decline in ethnic language use in the home from the foreign-born generation to the native-born tended to be lower for the more ethnically connected groups than for the less ethnically connected by religion. For example, the most ethnic of the ethnoreligious groups of German origin, i.e., German Lutherans, Mennonites and Hutterites, exhibited a generational decline of 60 per cent in the use of an ethnic language in the home, while the less ethnically connected exhibited declines ranging from 88 to 100 per cent. Similarly, the percentage decline between generations for the more ethnically connected Ukrainian groups, e.g., Ukrainian Catholics, and Eastern Orthodox, at about 81 per cent, was slightly but consistently less than that experienced by the less ethnically connected Ukrainian groups. Generational decline reflected in the foreign-born/native-born differences in the use of ethnic languages at home for

the remaining more ethnically connected groups ranged from a low of 47 per cent for Eastern Non-Christian Arabs to a high of about 68 per cent for the Other Eastern and South Asian Eastern Non-Christians. In every case, rates of decline were less than those of the less ethnically connected subgroups. At the same time, the percentage declines in use of an ethnic language at home were significantly greater than for the more ethnically connected subgroups than were reported in our earlier analysis of the 1981 census (Kalbach and Kalbach (1995).

To summarize, the most recent data still show that the native born and foreign born who identify with the more traditional ethnic churches within any ethnic origin group, experience higher ethnic language retention and suffer less generational language loss and weakening of their ethnic-connectedness than those who identify with the major Canadian churches or no particular church or religion. However, the intergenerational declines in the use of ethnic languages in the home reflected in the 1991 Census are noticeably greater than those previously reported.

### **Age at Immigration and Acculturation**

The central role played by language in the socialization process and in the transmission of cultural values makes it a particularly sensitive indicator of acculturation and assimilation. Using age at immigration categories of 0-12, 13-19, and 20+, earlier analysis of the 1981 data showed that age at immigration was positively related to the use of non-official languages in the home independent of the ethno-religious identity of the immigrant. Of the thirty-two ethno-religious groups analyzed, only six failed to show a consistent positive relationship (Kalbach and Kalbach, 1995). Analysis of the 1991 Census data presented in Table 1 shows a similar, generally positive relationship for all seven ethnic origin groups. There are a few inconsistencies in these patterns of positive relationships caused by the small size of the 15-19 year old groups. In every case, however, the percent reporting the use of ethnic languages in the home for those over 20 years of age significantly exceeded the percentage for those under 15 at the time of immigration. In the case of the 1981 Census the exceptions, in every case, were the lower than expected proportions of adult immigrants (arriving in Canada over twenty years of age) indicating that they did not use an ethnic language in the home. This was attributed to the fact that the adult immigrants of non-European origins appear to have been highly selected on the basis of their educational attainment and proficiency in their use of either English or French. In other words, Canada's criteria for selecting immigrants from non-European countries would appear to have favoured those immigrants showing evidence of prior acculturation in terms of their education and language skills.

For most, it is clear, that the younger the age at immigration the longer the period of exposure to acculturative forces and the greater the likelihood of a weakening of the pre-existing cultural ties, i.e., the ethnic connection, insofar as the use of ethnic language in the home is concerned. None of these "age-at-

immigration" groups appear to be completely immune to the effects of acculturation and assimilation. But, regardless of nativity, and age at immigration, those reporting a more traditional ethnic church or religious identity tended to be more resistant to the processes of acculturation and assimilation, insofar as their language behaviour is concerned. Their higher proportions using languages other than English or French in the home suggest that they are generally more ethnic or ethnically connected than those reporting the use of one of the two official languages. While the seven ethnic origin groups included in this analysis are not a representative sample of Canada's ethnic populations, they do represent a range of groups from the old and new European immigrations as well as the more recent Asian immigration to Canada. If the use of ethnic language in the home is taken as one of the indexes of cultural commitment or ethnic-connectedness, the degree of variability observed between ethno-religious groups suggests that these subgroups would be the more appropriate units to use for determining the relative significance of the ethnic cultural factor, or ethnic-connectedness, for intergroup differences in socioeconomic status attainment.

### **Differences in Educational Attainment and Socioeconomic Achievement**

In the early settlement of North America, the requisite for success was hard, physical, manual work needed for clearing land, building shelter and working the soil. Canada sought out the landless peasants of Europe to help it settle the west. However, with increasing industrialization and urbanization, skills in English (or French) and education have become increasingly important for socioeconomic achievement and social integration. That there were opportunities to do so can be attested to by virtue of the fact that the population of 5-19 year olds attending school in Canada increased from slightly more than 50 per cent to over 78 per cent in a period of almost sixty years from 1901 to 1961. Even so, by 1961 less than half of those who had finished their schooling had not completed more than an elementary school education (Kalbach, 1970). Higher incomes in an industrializing and technological society were increasingly tied to longer periods of training and higher educational attainment levels.

Between 1961 and 1991, the proportion of the population with less than grade 9 schooling declined from 44 per cent to just 14 per cent (Statistics Canada, 1993). This, of course, reflects not only the rising levels of educational attainment of the general native-born population, including the children of immigrants, but also the generally rising education levels throughout the world, as well as the tendency of immigration selection policies since the 1960s to favour the more highly educated immigrants. This analysis focuses on educational attainment levels as an index of socioeconomic status attainment not only for the more general and culturally heterogeneous origin groups as a whole, but also for the more individual ethno-religious subgroups of which they are comprised. More specifically, the focus is directed to the inter-ethno-religious group variation in ethnic-connectedness and its relationship to differences in

social and economic status of the older European and more recent non-European origin immigrant groups selected for this analysis.

## **Ethnic-Connectedness and Educational Achievement Levels**

First note the differences between the seven ethnic origin populations shown in Table 2. For the two older and more established minority populations of Germans and Ukrainians, 16 and 18 per cent respectively had achieved some university or degree by the time of the 1991 Census as compared to 18 per cent for the population of British origins. In contrast, only seven per cent of the more recent European immigrants of Portuguese origins had reported achieving similar educational levels. For the other four more recent non-European immigrant groups, educational achievement levels were significantly higher, in contrast to the historical pattern in which the more recent ethnic minority immigrants have generally exhibited lower levels of educational achievement than the established population. However, as these unusually high educational attainment levels are clearly the consequence of a highly selective immigration policy based on educational, occupational and language skill criteria, direct comparisons between ethnic origin groups, *per se*, are not very helpful for determining the effects of the ethnic factor vis-à-vis the achievement of socioeconomic status in Canada. In the case at hand, the more useful and valid comparisons would be those between the various ethno-religious groups within each of the major ethnic groupings while controlling for nativity, age, and age at immigration effects.

Given the assumption that individual ethnic identity or degree of ethnic-connectedness varies according to their association with a traditional ethnic church, Canadian church or no church, the data in Table 2 provide evidence of a generally negative relationship between ethnic-connectedness and social status levels in terms of educational attainment for most of the ethno-religious groups included in this analysis. However, the patterns are not as clear or as consistent as those found in the 1981 data (Kalbach and Kalbach, 1995). In the present case the most consistent evidence for a negative relationship is still provided by the German origin groups in which the lowest proportions with some university or degree are characteristic of the more traditional ethnically connected Lutheran/Mennonite/Hutterite group, while the highest levels are found for those reporting no religion, and intermediate levels are associated with those who identified with major Canadian churches. For the non-European origins, those identifying with Eastern Non-Christian religions tend to show the lowest proportion with some university or degree while those reporting no religion, tend to exhibit intermediate levels of educational attainment. Higher levels of educational attainment are reported for those identifying with one of the major Canadian Protestant churches. Overall the traditional educational differences that have characterized the native and foreign born minority ethnic populations are disappearing and have in fact reversed for three of the four non-European groups included in this analysis. The Portuguese are somewhat unique among the relatively newer immigrants in their greater ethnic-connectedness and low levels

*Persistence of Ethnicity and Inequality  
Among Canadian Immigrants*

**Table 2. Per Cent of the Population 15 Years of Age and Over With Some University or Degree for Selected Ethno-Religious Groups by Nativity and Age at Immigration for the Foreign Born, Canada: 1991**

Ethno-Religious Group	Total Population	Native Born	Foreign Born				Total  N
			Age at Immigration				
			Total	0-14	15-19	20+	
<b>British</b>	17.9	18.1	17.6	22.4	17.6	16.9	4,732,962
Roman Catholic	18.2	17.7	21.3	22.5	21.7	20.7	847,932
Anglican	18.6	19.8	16.8	20.7	12.1	16.4	937,366
United Church	17.8	17.9	17.1	19.7	15.8	16.9	1,076,999
Other Protestant	14.8	14.9	14.6	21.8	16.0	13.6	563,966
No Religion	21.7	19.8	28.0	29.9	27.3	27.5	629,099
<b>German</b>	16.5	16.7	16.3	22.8	10.8	12.8	808,399
Luth/Menn/Hutt	15.3	16.3	13.7	20.7	10.4	11.9	277,500
Roman Catholic	16.2	17.1	14.3	23.4	6.7	12.6	193,300
Anglican	17.6	16.4	19.4	25.6	16.6	28.4	25,500
United Church	15.3	13.8	21.6	27.4	14.8	20.1	73,300
Other Protestant	17.2	16.6	18.3	17.0	12.0	19.8	91,000
No Religion	20.3	28.9	23.7	31.8	21.8	19.5	95,333
<b>Ukrainian</b>	18.5	18.9	16.5	23.9	15.8	12.2	375,700
Ukrainain Catholic	22.0	22.9	19.0	37.8	26.0	11.8	84,667
Eastern Orthodox	17.7	18.3	15.1	20.3	10.8	12.3	73,967
Roman Catholic	17.0	17.5	12.9	17.7	4.3	8.5	77,700
Anglican	19.8	19.6	27.3	33.3	-	0.0	11,100
United Church	15.9	16.0	12.2	8.3	0.0	23.1	41,933
No Religion	19.6	19.4	22.0	22.9	15.4	23.3	44,467
<b>Portuguese</b>	7.2	13.9	5.8	13.6	3.9	2.9	192,600
Roman Catholic	6.8	13.4	5.5	12.8	4.0	2.7	182,400
Other Protestant	9.6	15.8	8.4	15.7	0.0	5.4	4,200
No Religion	20.0	28.2	17.2	34.4	0.0	9.8	4,167
<b>Arab</b>	37.7	26.3	39.4	33.0	30.0	41.6	107,400
Eastern Non-Christian	37.9	19.8	39.4	18.5	25.9	43.4	38,867
Eastern Orthodox	36.3	30.0	37.4	33.3	31.9	39.0	22,467
Roman Catholic	36.7	26.6	38.7	40.1	30.7	39.7	31,767
Other Protestant	40.9	33.4	41.5	30.4	38.9	43.3	7,900
No Religion	48.6	27.8	55.3	50.0	25.0	59.1	2,467
<b>South Asian</b>	32.3	24.3	32.9	38.5	23.4	33.1	314,400
Eastern Non-Christian	30.9	21.5	31.6	36.5	21.7	32.1	256,933
Roman Catholic	38.6	32.8	39.1	44.2	42.6	37.3	24,533
Anglican	41.3	28.6	43	57.1	22.2	44.1	3,800
Other Protestant	27	16.2	28.3	39.6	13.6	27.1	11,133
No Religion	39	37	39.6	48.2	32.1	36.8	7,600
<b>Chinese</b>	33.5	44.6	32.1	39.4	33.7	30.5	454,433
Eastern Non-Christian	15.7	18.7	15.6	21.4	17.6	14.4	58,233
Roman Catholic	41.6	39.2	41.8	46.7	55.1	39.3	60,567
Anglican	46.1	46.7	46.1	53.1	41.1	45.0	7,000
United Church	46.4	57.2	36.9	55.9	31.6	31.3	9,400
Baptist	53.8	60.6	53.3	62.8	42.9	52.8	12,867
Other Protestant	49.6	52.6	49.2	55.5	60.0	46.6	35,033
No Religion	31.2	43.2	29.6	36.9	28.6	28.4	259,900
<b>Other Eastern and South Eastern Asian</b>	36.1	33.2	37.4	32.5	22.3	40.2	106,500
Eastern Non-Christian	21.8	20.4	22.2	13.1	5.2	26.1	31,333
Roman Catholic	39.9	35.6	40.5	29.3	24.1	45.1	12,533
United Church	43.3	39.3	53.2	43.8	55.5	55.1	10,867
Other Protestant	44.1	33.3	46.4	39.5	25.9	49.8	12,100
No Religion	42.2	42.2	42.2	35.5	22.8	45.3	24,800

Source: Statistics Canada, 1991 Census of Canada. Public Use Microdata File, Individual File.

of educational attainment. Only the native born and those who immigrated as children who have disaffiliated themselves from the Roman Catholic Church, have succeeded in achieving educational levels equaling or exceeding those of the British or other European origins included in this comparative analysis.

### **Ethnic-Connectedness, Occupational Status and Family Income**

The immigrants language skills and educational attainment levels have long been considered predictive of the immigrants ability to become successfully integrated into Canadian society. Yet, until recently, multiculturalists have generally argued that retention of one's distinctive cultural characteristics and ethnic identity should not significantly limit one's socioeconomic integration and achievement in Canada (Isajiw, Sev'er, and Driedger, 1993). However, the evidence from our past and current research continues to speak to the contrary.

In this analysis, the two indexes of economic status used to examine the effects of "ethnic-connectedness" are the proportions of the population 15 years and over reporting professional and managerial occupations, and average total family incomes of \$50,000 or more. The occupational measure provides a rough index of a group's relative social status position. The index based on family income provides an estimate of a group's "achieved" economic status as residents of Canada and represents the group's ability to realize its demographic potential in terms of economic rewards.

A comparative analysis of the data, shown in Tables 3 and 4, reveals the nature of the relationship between ethnoreligious groups of varying degree of "ethnic connectedness" and the two indicators of socioeconomic status. While the index based on occupation provides an approximation of the relative achieved status position of the group as a whole, it may tend to overestimate their status in much the same way as would be the case when using education as an index of socioeconomic status. In either case, Canada's current non-discriminatory but selective immigration policies re the "independent" class of immigrants favour and encourage the admission of only the most educated having qualifications and experience in technical, professional and managerial occupations. For this reason, indexes based on income are more likely to be reflective of the individual's "achieved" status while residing in Canada, and because evidence from numerous studies have suggested that indexes based on income are particularly sensitive to the ethnic factor with respect to the types of work available, and wages and salaries, etc. (Li, 1988; Driedger, 1989, Anderson and Frideres, 1981).

The index of occupational status, i.e., proportions in professional and managerial occupations, for the selected ethnoreligious groups are given in Table 3 for the native and foreign-born components and by age at immigration for the foreign born. Data for the population of British origins, as in Table 2,

are included here for comparative purposes in order to assess the position of the minority ethnic groups vis-à-vis the historically and culturally dominant population of British origins. In this case it is quite noticeable that the two older ethnic minority groups (in terms of their period of major immigration), i.e., Germans and Ukrainians, are not significantly different from the British origin population. Twenty-six and 28 per cent of the German and Ukrainian origin groups reported professional and managerial occupations compared to 27 per cent for the British. In contrast, all but one of the non-European origin groups were shown to have proportions of over 30 per cent while the South Asians proportion was only 25 per cent. Those of Portuguese origin are again, as in the case of their educational attainment levels, an anomaly of sorts with only 12 per cent in professional and managerial occupations. This, of course, is consistent with their very low educational attainment levels, previously shown in Table 2.

It would appear that the more selective immigration policies since the 1960s stressing the language and occupational skills needed for successful integration into an urbanized and post industrial society have been quite successful to the extent that the foreign-born populations, on average, have better educational credentials (on paper) than their native-born counterparts. This policy of admitting only the most highly qualified of the non-European applicants is beginning to change the historical negative relationship between age at immigration and socioeconomic status achievement in which the younger immigrants tended to have a competitive advantage, when entering the labour force, over those who came to Canada in their late teens or beyond. In a similar fashion, the purposive selection of only those non-European populations who are more skilled or have professional and managerial occupations or qualify as entrepreneurs, appear to be reducing the historical advantage in employment opportunities enjoyed by the more educated native-born population.

Recent research (Jiobu, 1994) has shown how a group's demographics can limit its socioeconomic status characteristics independently of its ethnic origins. When one examines the data for either the total or the native and foreign-born populations in Table 3 and compares the proportions professional and managerial for the most ethnic ethno-religious groups with the other ethno-religious groups within each of the general origin categories, the observed differences strongly support the findings from earlier analyses of both the 1971 and 1981 Census data (Kalbach and Richard, 1991a, 1991b, 1990, 1988, 1980; Kalbach and Kalbach, 1995). The greater ethnic-connectedness in the traditional ethnic churches of minority immigrant groups tends to be associated with lower indexes of socioeconomic status. The higher indexes of socioeconomic status characterize those populations identifying with major Canadian churches, such as the Roman Catholic, Anglican or United Church, or those indicating no religious preference or affiliation.

The relationship between ethnic-connectedness and the other index of socioeconomic status based on average total family income, appears to be more consistent for the ethnic origin groups shown than that between ethnic-connectedness and the index based on proportions of the populations in

**Table 3. Per Cent of the Population Aged 35-54 in Professional and Managerial Occupations for Selected Ethno-Religious Groups by Nativity and Age at Immigration for the Foreign Born, Canada: 1991**

Ethno-Religious Group	Total Population	Native Born	Foreign Born				Total N
			Total	0-14	15-19	20+	
<b>British</b>	33.6	33.3	34.1	41.0	32.6	33.2	1,380,499
Roman Catholic	33.5	32.4	37.7	35.8	29.7	39.3	208,266
Anglican	36.1	36.2	35.8	42.4	23.2	35.5	266,533
United Church	33.9	34.1	33.2	37.8	35.9	32.7	310,366
Other Protestant	29.4	29.0	30.1	35.9	27.4	29.4	161,467
No Religion	37.2	33.9	45.7	48.4	45.4	45.0	206,633
<b>German</b>	31.3	29.5	34.7	38.2	26.0	34.7	238,300
Luth/Menn/Hutt	31.3	29.8	33.7	37.5	26.2	33.6	79,133
Roman Catholic	39.9	28.8	32.0	34.8	15.3	35.3	56,900
Anglican	31.9	27.5	38.9	38.5	50.0	38.5	8,267
United Church	32.8	30.9	41.6	57.7	53.2	28.3	23,167
Other Protestant	32.6	31.3	35.2	33.3	26.3	38.7	27,033
No Religious Preference	34.2	29.9	41.6	42.3	35.7	42.0	28,800
<b>Ukrainian</b>	34.3	33.3	46.4	51.2	50.0	26.0	106,400
Ukrainian Catholic	39.9	37.3	54.5	62.7	20.0	40.7	22,033
Eastern Orthodox	30.3	29.1	40.7	42.3	33.3	36.4	18,433
Roman Catholic	33.7	33.3	37.8	42.3	66.6	35.0	21,600
Anglican	37.5	37.2	50.0	50.0	-	-	3,733
United Church	32.3	32.1	50.0	50.0	-	-	13,333
No Religious Preference	34.8	33.6	56.5	60.0	100.0	20.0	14,067
Portuguese	11.4	47.6	11.0	20.3	14.0	8.9	57,100
Roman Catholic	11.2	40.0	10.7	19.3	14.2	8.8	54,200
Other Protestant	15.6	-	15.6	75.0	-	7.4	1,067
No Religious Preference	23.1	66.6	19.4	25.0	-	18.5	1,300
<b>Arab</b>	43.1	46.2	42.8	52.0	35.9	43.1	30,000
Eastern Non-Christian	40.9	44.4	40.9	50.0	42.8	40.6	9,767
Eastern Orthodox	47.9	58.8	46.9	50.0	33.4	48.6	6,533
Roman Catholic	41.1	40.7	41.1	55.5	33.3	41.3	9,567
Other Protestant	40.6	50.0	40.3	0.0	50.0	41.1	2,133
No Religious Preference	47.8	100.0	42.9	100.0	0.0	42.0	767
<b>South Asian</b>	31.1	37.5	31.1	47.8	29.7	30.9	103,633
Eastern Non-Christian	30.5	40.0	30.4	53.1	25.0	30.4	83,200
Roman Catholic	32.0	50.0	31.6	33.4	68.8	29.1	9,167
Anglican	41.9	100.0	40.5	0.0	0.0	44.8	1,433
Other Protestant	30.3	16.7	31.0	40.0	40.0	30.1	3,967
No Religious Preference	35.4	33.3	35.5	0.0	25.0	37.7	2,167
<b>Chinese</b>	38.5	48.5	38.1	53.6	39.0	37.2	138,767
Eastern Non-Christian	24.8	-	24.8	72.8	17.7	23.9	16,533
Roman Catholic	45.8	41.7	45.9	68.8	46.6	45.2	2,460
Anglican	47.3	22.2	50.0	66.7	14.3	52.8	3,033
United Church	54.7	72.0	45.8	80.0	25.0	45.7	2,433
Baptist	50.8	100.0	50.0	28.6	45.5	51.8	4,533
Other Protestant	44.5	43.8	44.5	53.9	68.2	42.1	10,500
No Religious Preference	36.2	47.1	35.8	48.3	34.8	35.1	73,900
<b>Other Eastern and South Eastern Asian</b>	48.9	57.3	46.6	72.7	75.0	45.5	33,133
Eastern Non-Christian	28.6	37.5	27.2	66.6	50.0	26.5	8,167
Roman Catholic	48.9	45.5	49.2	-	100.0	48.4	4,500
United Church	60.8	60.0	61.9	100.0	100.0	57.9	3,400
Other Protestant	46.4	66.6	44.2	50.0	-	42.1	4,167
No Religious Preference	58.5	62.8	56.6	50.0	60.0	56.6	8,200

Source: Statistics Canada, 1991 Census of Canada. Public Use Microdata File, Individual File.



*Persistence of Ethnicity and Inequality  
Among Canadian Immigrants*

**Table 4. Per Cent of the Population 15 Years of Age and Over with Family Incomes of \$50,000+ for Selected Ethno-Religious Groups by Nativity and Age at Immigration for the Foreign Born, Canada: 1991**

Ethno-Religious Group	Total Population	Native Born	Foreign Born				Total N
			Age at Immigration				
			Total	0-14	15-19	20+	
British	47.6	50.1	42.7	54.7	55.4	40.7	3,767,563
Roman Catholic	51.4	50.2	59.4	60.4	62.2	59.2	694,466
Anglican	48.7	52.5	43.4	55.1	55.1	43.1	877,332
United Church	49.3	52.2	40.1	51.0	50.0	39.7	1,039,066
Other Protestant	38.7	42.5	31.3	48.1	56.4	30.9	562,566
No Religious Preference	46.9	46.2	49.7	58.2	59.1	49.9	619,233
German	45.8	46.2	44.9	54.4	52.5	40.3	640,266
Luth/Menn/Hutt	42.2	41.8	42.9	53.8	52.2	39.0	253,300
Roman Catholic	47.7	48.0	47.7	60.3	56.5	41.6	175,100
Anglican	46.8	48.8	44.8	63.2	72.7	40.0	22,733
United Church	47.5	47.1	49.7	57.8	65.2	43.6	66,133
Other Protestant	41.5	41.3	42.2	43.7	42.2	42.2	84,100
No Religious Preference	44.9	44.1	47.0	57.6	48.5	42.7	81,900
Ukrainian	46.7	48.6	33.3	50.8	33.3	22.3	284,400
Ukrainain Catholic	44.8	47.5	35.2	58.5	41.4	26.6	70,800
Eastern Orthodox	44.3	46.9	30.5	50.0	40.0	16.2	59,033
Roman Catholic	46.5	47.9	30.6	50.8	15.4	18.5	64,367
Anglican	53.1	53.1	55.6	50.0	-	100.0	9,533
United Church	49.3	49.6	36.0	66.7	0.0	25.0	37,367
No Religious Preference	48.0	48.7	35.7	44.1	14.3	30.8	34,933
Portuguese	47.6	60.0	45.1	55.4	45.1	40.6	172,266
Roman Catholic	47.9	60.6	45.3	55.8	45.0	40.8	164,233
Other Protestant	28.8	31.3	28.4	36.7	0.0	25.0	3,467
No Religious Preference	57.9	52.2	59.7	69.6	71.4	52.4	3,167
Arab	35.5	50.4	30.9	43.0	32.4	28.8	86,800
Eastern Non-Christian	24.2	36.7	23.0	32.1	22.9	22.0	31,133
Eastern Orthodox	42.0	62.7	38.4	57.6	45.6	35.1	18,900
Roman Catholic	37.5	51.1	34.7	42.4	38.7	32.6	25,900
Other Protestant	33.0	68.8	29.6	50.0	13.3	28.4	6,167
No Religious Preference	34.1	38.5	32.3	50.0	50.0	26.1	1,467
South Asian	43.5	61.1	42.1	54.9	40.2	39.7	266,400
Eastern Non-Christian	40.2	57.2	39.0	51.7	37.0	36.9	218,566
Roman Catholic	60.4	85.2	58.0	74.1	63.8	53.1	20,767
Anglican	65.6	45.5	68.2	50.0	100.0	65.7	3,200
Other Protestant	48.4	68.8	45.7	58.7	42.9	42.6	9,167
No Religious Preference	52.5	48.5	53.1	51.1	59.1	52.5	6,000
Chinese	45.2	69.1	42.1	55.5	50.0	38.2	375,935
Eastern Non-Christian	31.3	48.5	30.9	38.1	42.4	27.9	47,467
Roman Catholic	55.9	67.9	54.7	67.2	61.1	51.4	50,767
Anglican	65.4	70.8	64.6	79.3	43.8	63.7	6,067
United Church	56.5	66.3	48.4	63.3	50.0	41.9	7,433
Baptist	53.9	72.0	52.4	50.0	56.3	52.3	10,567
Other Protestant	52.6	78.0	49.1	58.8	65.4	44.6	27,767
No Religious Preference	43.1	70.3	39.4	54.8	46.7	35.0	216,400
Other Eastern and							
South Eastern Asian	44.6	67.1	35.0	46.5	25.5	33.5	85,633
Eastern Non-Christian	36.7	62.0	28.9	35.0	10.9	30.0	25,133
Roman Catholic	40.1	66.7	36.4	46.3	29.2	34.7	10,633
United Church	60.2	68.0	42.4	64.3	50.0	36.5	9,300
Other Protestant	36.8	66.0	30.7	48.6	34.8	26.9	10,133
No Religious Preference	52.2	72.6	41.2	48.4	38.5	39.7	18,067

Source: Statistics Canada, 1991 Census of Canada. Public Use Microdata File, Individual File.

professional and managerial occupations. Those identifying with the more ethnic churches appear to be more clearly disadvantaged with respect to their average total family incomes than those identifying with any of the major Canadian churches or claiming no religious preference. In this case the European origin groups, including the Portuguese, with proportions reporting average total family incomes of \$50,000 and over were similar to the level (48 per cent) reported for the population of British origins. But, contrary to the situation with regard to educational attainment levels of the non-European groups, their proportions reporting family incomes of over \$50,000 were consistently lower than those for the European groups. Their somewhat higher educational attainment levels were not reflected in their proportions reporting average total family incomes of \$50,000 and over, which ranged between 36 to 45 per cent, compared to a range of 46 to 48 per cent for the European origin groups. The differences are even greater if only the proportions for the more ethnic churches of the European and non-European origin groups are compared. In the case of the former, the proportions range from 42 to 48 per cent, while for the latter, they range from 24 per cent for the Eastern Non-Christian Arab origins to a high of 40 per cent of the Eastern Non-Christian South Asian origins.

Length of residence as reflected in period of immigration (Table 5), reveals the usual positive relationship vis-à-vis the proportion reporting family incomes of \$50,000 or more for all ethnic origin groups included in the analysis. The relationship is the same for almost all of the ethno-religious sub-groups, with three notable exceptions. The less ethnically connected Anglican British origins, United Church of German origins and Other Protestant Portuguese, where the most recent immigrants show the highest proportion with family incomes of \$50,000 and over. The only other ethno-religious groups where the most recent immigrants have a proportion of families with incomes of \$50,000+ almost equal to that of the pre-1981 immigrants are the less ethnically-connected South Asian Anglicans.

To what extent this may reflect the effects of varying degrees of ethnic-connectedness or the results of a more selective immigration policy is difficult to say. However, of the sixteen ethno-religious and period of immigration groups shown in Table 5, the groups reporting the highest percentage of families with incomes over \$50,000 were the Anglicans, United Church, Other Protestant, No Religious Preference and Roman Catholic. Even though the Ns are quite small, a similar analysis controlling for age was undertaken. The patterns with respect to income reported by those who indicate an affiliation with an ethnic church, a Canadian church or no church still held for those who were between 35 and 54 years of age.

## **Summary and Conclusions**

In spite of differences in some of the 1991 Census variables in terms of either available categories or changes in variable definitions such as age at immigration and ethnic origin respectively, the findings of this analysis generally support

*Persistence of Ethnicity and Inequality  
Among Canadian Immigrants*

**Table 5. Per Cent of the Population 15 Years of Age and Over with Family Incomes of \$50,000+ for Selected Ethno-Religious Groups by Nativity and Period of Immigration for the Foreign Born, Canada: 1991**

Ethno-Religious Group	Total Population	Native Born	Foreign Born			Total N
			Period of Immigration			
			Total	Pre-1981	1981-1991	
<b>British</b>	47.6	50.1	42.7	55.8	50.6	3,767,563
Roman Catholic	51.4	50.2	59.4	61.4	52.8	694,466
Anglican	48.7	52.5	43.4	54.8	56.4	877,332
United Church	49.3	52.2	40.1	51.4	45.5	1,039,066
Other Protestant	38.7	42.5	31.3	50.4	42.1	562,566
No Religious Preference	46.9	46.2	49.7	61.5	50.7	619,233
<b>German</b>	45.8	46.2	44.9	47.2	36.6	640,266
Luth/Menn/Hutt	42.2	41.8	42.9	45.9	32.2	253,300
Roman Catholic	47.7	48.0	47.7	48.6	32.4	175,100
Anglican	46.8	48.8	44.8	66.3	57.1	22,733
United Church	47.5	47.1	49.7	49.0	61.5	66,133
No Religious Preference	44.9	44.1	47.0	50.0	41.1	81,900
<b>Ukrainian</b>	46.7	48.6	33.3	35.1	14.9	284,400
Ukrainain Catholic	44.8	47.5	35.2	37.1	21.4	70,800
Eastern Orthodox	44.3	46.9	30.5	32.4	12.5	59,033
Roman Catholic	46.5	47.9	30.6	34.8	5.9	64,367
Anglican	53.1	53.1	55.6	55.6	-	9,533
United Church	49.3	49.6	36.0	37.5	-	37,367
No Religious Preference	48.0	48.7	35.7	39.6	16.7	34,933
<b>Portuguese</b>	47.6	60.0	45.1	48.8	29.7	172,266
Roman Catholic	47.9	60.6	45.3	49.0	29.2	164,233
Other Protestant	28.8	31.3	28.4	27.1	33.3	3,467
No Religious Preference	57.9	52.2	59.7	61.5	55.0	3,167
<b>Arab</b>	35.5	50.4	30.9	48.5	19.5	86,800
Eastern Non-Christian	24.2	36.7	23.0	37.3	17.7	31,133
Eastern Orthodox	42.0	62.7	38.4	56.6	23.6	18,900
Roman Catholic	37.5	51.1	34.7	53.3	16.6	25,900
Other Protestant	33.0	68.8	29.6	50.9	19.6	6,167
No Religious Preference	34.1	38.5	32.3	60.0	10.0	1,467
<b>South Asian</b>	43.5	61.1	42.1	55.6	25.8	266,400
Eastern Non-Christian	40.2	57.2	39.0	52.2	24.4	218,566
Roman Catholic	60.4	85.2	58.0	74.8	30.4	20,767
Anglican	65.6	45.5	68.2	70.0	66.7	3,200
Other Protestant	48.4	68.8	45.7	62.3	24.0	9,167
No Religious Preference	52.5	48.5	53.1	58.1	39.5	6,000
<b>Chinese</b>	45.2	69.1	42.1	56.7	30.2	375,935
Eastern Non-Christian	31.3	48.5	30.9	42.3	23.7	47,467
Roman Catholic	55.9	67.9	54.7	68.3	38.7	50,767
Anglican	65.4	70.8	64.6	69.5	53.8	6,067
United Church	56.5	66.3	48.4	55.0	37.5	7,433
Baptist	53.9	72.0	52.4	64.3	39.7	10,567
Other Protestant	52.6	78.0	49.1	63.1	39.6	27,767
No Religious Preference	43.1	70.3	39.4	54.4	27.8	216,400
<b>Other Eastern and South Eastern Asian</b>	44.6	67.1	35.0	44.5	22.1	85,633
Eastern Non-Christian	36.7	62.0	28.9	36.0	18.9	25,133
Roman Catholic	40.1	66.7	36.4	42.8	29.2	10,633
United Church	60.2	68.0	42.4	49.1	22.7	9,300
Other Protestant	36.8	66.0	30.7	44.5	18.5	10,133
No Religious Preference	52.2	72.6	41.2	52.2	21.5	18,067

Source: Statistics Canada, 1991 Census of Canada. Public Use Microdata File, Individual File.

the results of earlier studies based on the 1971 and 1981 Census data. In general, the 1991 data provide evidence of a narrowing of differences and a trend toward convergence. As before, the greater use of an ethnic language in the home was associated with the traditional ethnic church for each origin group, while identification with the major Canadian churches or those with no religious preference was associated with less use of ethnic languages in the home and greater linguistic assimilation. Similarly, the analyses of educational attainment data reveal the same general negative relationship between ethnic-connectedness and social status in terms of educational attainment levels reported for most of the selected ethno-religious groups included in the analysis.

Individuals in the more traditional ethno-religious groups who exhibit their greater commitment or ethnic-connectedness through greater use of their ethnic language in the home not only reported lower levels of educational attainment, but also, lower indexes of occupational status and average total family income. In addition, the crosstabular analysis of the 1991 data was consistent with similar analyses of earlier census data which reported a negative relationship between age at immigration and attainment of higher educational levels and higher levels of economic status achievement reflected in indexes of occupational status and total family income. The data also reveal that immigrants who come here as children tend to out-do their foreign-born parents and the native-born. This supports the findings of the Richmond-Kalbach (1980) monograph on the adjustment of immigrants based on the 1971 Census.

These results suggest that the effects of Canada's highly selective immigration policy based on a point system which has increasingly emphasized desirable personal, linguistic, occupational and educational attributes, are becoming visible to the extent that the non-European immigrants' educational and occupational status profiles are exceeding those of the more established British and European origin populations. It seems safe to say that among the more recent applicants, the more "westernized" in terms of their language, education and occupational characteristics are being selected to a greater extent than ever before. However, in spite of this, their economic status indexes based on total family income continue to be below those of the older and more established European ethnic minority groups. Canada's newest arrivals can still be found in disproportionate numbers in the lower income ranges despite having characteristics which might suggest that this should be otherwise. This may reflect in part the reluctance of employers to fully recognize recent immigrants' professional qualifications or to offer lower wages or salaries in lieu of Canadian experience, especially to non-European immigrants. What evidence there is that points to a narrowing of the differentials and a trend toward convergence suggests that this is likely to continue into the 21st century if Canadian immigration policy continues to favour those who are already partially "westernized" to some degree before being admitted as immigrants to Canada. In the long run greater equality would appear to be assured if Canada continues to select immigrants with young children, those who already speak English or French and those with high levels of education and professional and technical skills. In view of the trend toward convergence, multicultural policies that encourage the retention of

distinctive ethno-cultural characteristics should take cognizance of the potential social and economic costs of such policies given the expected continuation of relatively high levels of "visible minority" immigration into the 21st century.

**References:**

- Anderson, A.B., and J.S. Frideres. 1981. *Ethnicity in Canada: Theoretical Perspectives*. Toronto: Butterworths, pp. 289-298.
- Boyd, Monica, John Goyder, Frank Jones, Hugh McRoberts, Peter Pineo and John Porter. 1985. *Ascription and Achievement: Studies in Mobility and Status Attainment in Canada*. Ottawa: Carleton University Press.
- Breton, Raymond, Wsevolod, W. Isajiw, Warren E. Kalbach, and Jeffrey G. Reitz. 1990. *Ethnic Identity and Equality*. Toronto: University Press.
- Darroch, A. Gordon, and Wilfrd G. Marston, 1969. "Ethnic differentiation: ecological aspects of a multidimensional concept," *The International Migration Review* 4: 71-95.
- Driedger, Leo. 1989. *The Ethnic Factor: Identity in Diversity*. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson.
- Economic Council of Canada. 1991. *Economic and Social Impacts of Immigration*. Ottawa: Minister of Supply & Services.
- Gordon, Milton M. 1964. *Assimilation in American Life*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Greeley, Andrew M. 1971. *Why Can't They Be Like Us?* New York: E.P. Dutton.
- Inbar, M. 1977. "Immigration and learning: The vulnerable age," *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology* 14: 218-234.
- Isajiw, W.W., A. Sev'er and L. Driedger. 1993. "Ethnic identity and social mobility: a test of the drawback model," *The Canadian Journal of Sociology* Vol.18(2): 177-196.
- Jiobu, Robert M. 1988. *Ethnicity and Assimilation*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Jones, Frank E., 1987. "Age at immigration and education: further explorations," *International Migration Review* XXI (1): 70-85.
- Kalbach, Warren, E. 1970. *The Impact of Immigration on Canada's Population*. Ottawa: Information Canada.

- Kalbach Madeline A. and Warren E. Kalbach. 1995. "The importance of ethnic-connectedness for Canada's post-war immigrants," *Canadian Ethnic Studies*. XXVII(2): 16-33.
- Kalbach, Warren E. and Madeline A. Richard. 1991a. Ethnic-religious identification and generation as correlates of acculturation and socio-economic attainment. In Robin Ostrow, Jürgen Fijalkowski, Y. Michael Bodeman, Hans Merken (Eds.). *Ethnic Structured Inequality, and the State in Canada and the Federal Republic of Germany*. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, pp. 179-98.
- Kalbach, Warren E. and Madeline A. Richard. 1991b. The religious dimension of minority group assimilation in Canada. In Jürgen Fijalkowski, Hans Merken and Folker Schmidt (Eds.). *Dominant National Cultures and Ethnic Identities*. Berlin: Freie Universität Berlin, pp. 145-155.
- Kalbach, Warren E. and Madeline A. Richard. 1988. Ethnic-religious identity, acculturation, and social and economic achievement of Canada's post-war minority populations. *The Review of Demography and Its Implications for Economic and Social Policy Ottawa: The Demographic Review*. Secretariat and the Royal Society of Canada (5): 62-64.
- Kalbach, Warren E. and Madeline A. Richard. 1985a. Ethnic-connectedness: How binding is the tie? *Heritage Review: Germans From Russia Heritage Society* 15(2): 49-54.
- Kalbach, Warren E. and Madeline A. Richard. 1985b. The Significance of Age at Immigration for Assimilation. Paper presented at the *8th Biennial Conference of CESA*, October 17, 1985.
- Kalbach, Warren E. and Madeline A. Richard. 1980. The Differential Effects of Ethno-Religious Structure on Linguistic Trends and the Economic Achievement of Ukrainians. In W. R. Petryshyn (Ed.) *Changing Realities: Social Trends Among Ukrainian Canadians*. Edmonton: The Canadian Institute of Ukrainian Studies, pp. 78-96.
- Kornacker, Mildred. 1971. "Cultural significance of intermarriage: A comparative approach," *International Journal of the Sociology of the Family*. Special Issue, pp. 147-56.
- Li, Peter S. 1988. *Ethnic Inequality in a Class Society*. Toronto: Wall and Thompson Inc.
- Liebertson, Stanley. 1963. *Ethnic Patterns in American Cities*. New York: The Free Press of Glencoe.
- Porter, John. 1965. *The Vertical Mosaic*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

*Persistence of Ethnicity and Inequality  
Among Canadian Immigrants*

- Richmond, A.H. and W.E. Kalbach. 1980. *Factors in the Adjustment of Immigrants and Their Descendants*. Statistics Canada. Ottawa: Minister of Supply and Services.
- Richard, Madeline A. 1991. *Ethnic Groups and Marital Choices*. Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Ryder, N. 1955. "The Interpretation of Origin Statistics," *Canadian Journal of Economic and Political Sciences* 21(4): 466-479.
- Statistics Canada. 1993. *Educational Attainment and School Attendance*. Ottawa: Industry, Science and Technology Canada, 1991 Census of Canada. Catalogue Number 93-328.
- Yinger, Milton J. 1968. "Ethnicity," *Annual Review of Sociology* 11: 151-180.
- 

*Received February 1998; Revised February 1999*

