

*Migration Without Borders: Essays
on the Free Movement of People*

edited by Antoine Pécoud and Paul de Guchteneire
Herndon, VA: Berghahn Books/ UNESCO, 2009

ISBN: 978-1845453602

Paperback \$39.95; 288 pp.

Reviewed by Yasmeen Abu-Laban

Department of Political Science

University of Alberta

yasmeen.abu-laban@ualberta.ca

Jointly published by the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) and Berghahn Books, *Migration Without Borders* is a rare edited collection that simultaneously pushes the boundaries of what both policymakers and scholars may legitimately consider in relation to migration theory. The book's foreword, written by Pierre Sané, the Assistant Director-General for Social and Human Sciences at UNESCO, captures why. "Imagine a world without borders, where people had the right to move freely from one country to another, to settle down, live and work wherever they wished. Today, with states strictly controlling their frontiers, this sounds like Utopia. But what if the idea of migration without borders was worth considering?" (p. ix).

In taking up their consideration of migration without borders, editors Antoine Pécoud and Paul de Guchteneire have assembled an impressive and diverse list of contributors, whose expertise covers many disciplines of the social sciences and, in some cases, also involves direct experience in such international organizations as the United Nations (UN) and the European Union (EU). Equally compelling is the fact that authors are located in countries of the global North and the global South, and the topical coverage by the authors considers both North and South. Rarely indeed has such systematic attention been paid to a broad comparative context in grappling with the economic, social, human rights, and ethical implications of the idea of "migration without borders."

The volume begins with a tight introductory chapter by Pécoud and de Guchteneire, which points out that while the UN Universal Declaration of Human Rights grants the right to emigrate (that is, to leave one's country), this is not backed by a right to immigrate (that is, to enter another country of one's choice). The trend towards increased border control and surveillance that has characterized contemporary migration is costly in both economic and human rights terms, and

therefore makes thinking about migration without borders relevant from scholarly, policymaking, as well as ethical perspectives.

The chapters that follow are divided into two major sections. The “Theoretical Issues” section starts with an overview of the challenges of a “world labour market” by Nigel Harris. A strength of Harris’s chapter is its attention to history, which reminds readers of how migration has been historically normal. Catherine Wihtol de Wenden’s chapter compels consideration of the relationship between migration control and its harm to democratic ideals. Mehmet Ugur and Bimal Ghosh pursue economic rationales for free movement in their contributions, with Ugur focusing on labour migration and Ghosh presenting more broadly on human mobility, including asylum seekers and family reunification, making a case for what he calls “managed migration.” Besides differing in their attention on who should move, Ugur argues for the utility of a new multilateral organization to regulate international migration, while Ghosh suggests changes might be possible in relation to extant organizations. The book’s “Theoretical Issues” section concludes with a chapter by Han Entzinger that addresses the implications of immigration on the welfare state, with reference to Western European countries. His suggestion that welfare states cope better with immigrants that are viewed as economically advantageous, and with newcomers that elicit a sense of solidarity from the native-born, raises still more questions about the possibility of “migration without borders.”

The second section deals with “Regional Perspectives.” Considerable scholarly work has been done already on the EU and mobility (owing to the advent of pan-European citizenship through the 1992 Maastricht Treaty), and to a lesser extent work has also been done on North America (owing to the 1994 North American Free Trade Agreement between Canada, the United States, and Mexico). The strength of this section is that it provides coverage of North America and the EU, but also considers world regions not typically addressed: Africa, Asia, and South America. The chapter by Jan Kunz and Mari Leinonen on Europe briefly reviews the well known fact that the weakening of internal borders (to allow for the mobility of European citizens between EU member states) was followed by a fortification of external borders, particularly vis-à-vis nationals from countries of the developing world. They trace other possible scenarios, concluding that it is unlikely that internal borders will become fortified again, and also unlikely that external borders will become more open. The chapter by Rafael Alarcón traces how the NAFTA arrangement favours skilled workers (business people, professionals), showing that Mexican nationals in particular have not benefitted much from this arrangement. In their contribution, Alejandro I. Canales and Israel Montiel Armas address Mexican migration to the United States, emphasizing that migrants have tended to take unskilled/low wage jobs, and that there is a growing linguistic and cultural transnationalism in the United States as a result. The chapters on other world regions include Aderanti Adepojur writing on West Africa, Sally Pebedrdy and Jonathan Crush writing on southern Africa, Graziano Battistella addressing Asia, and Alicia Maguid examining the South American Cone. As a package, the chapters on world regions other than Europe and North America suggest these regions still have far to go in order for “migration without borders” to be a reality.

This book has much to commend it, and should be treated as a “must-read” by migration specialists. It would also work well in senior undergraduate and grad-

uate courses dealing with migration, given the span of coverage and the debates it may provoke.

That said, the volume is not without silences. A stunning silence concerns gender. As feminist scholars have pointed out, the ability to move, and the category of entry of accepted migrants, is typically gendered. An emphasis on labour migration (typically read by Western governments as the value of facilitating the entry of *skilled* migrants) may advantage the types of training and education that are more accessible to male children and adults; as a consequence, downplaying the value of family-class migration is also not neutral. More broadly, attending to all factors that may facilitate or prevent mobility—even if *the right to do so exists*—demands attention to the particular circumstances that certain groups face, which in turn demands attention to gender (as well as class and/or other forms of social divide).

Another point is that this volume gives little attention to the colonial (or post-colonial) context in which migration has operated historically and contemporaneously, nor how racism/xenophobia may play out today. Indeed, of all the contributions, the chapter by Peberdy and Crush attends to racism/xenophobia the most, as they grapple with post-apartheid South Africa, but it would have been a welcome addition in other discussions.

Finally, the book is marked by a state-focused emphasis (governments, multi-lateral organizations, international organizations), but full attention to a migration-without-borders strategy should consider (global) civil society too. Indeed, since it is state actors (and state borders) that typically restrict migration, it is surprising that an actual strategy of “selling” a migration-without-borders scenario to state actors in the post-September 11, 2001 context, where “security” has emerged as central, is not provided in the book. If the ability to move is really an unfulfilled *human right*, then attention to actors that view it this way might provide clues for such a strategy. In this respect, such trans-national civil society groups as “No One is Illegal” are deserving of attention, because they provide a vision based on a profound sense of human rights and dignity. Articulating this vision is all the more relevant since, after reading what contributors to this volume have to say, it is pretty clear that a full-blown “migration without borders” scenario is not yet embraced by state policymakers in the early years of this century.